



Promoting Accountability of Public Resources

AUDITOR GENERAL'S REPORT of FACTUAL FINDINGS



Agreed Upon Procedures on the Interim Financial Report (IFR) Based Disbursement Procedures for the Tree Crop Extension Project (TCEP I).

Loan Number: 2000000632
ASAP Grant Number: 2000001473
IFAD Additional Loan Number: 2000003091
IFAD DSF Grant Number: 2000003090
RPSF Grant Number: 2000003561

For the Year Ended December 31, 2024

May 2025

P. Garswa Jackson, Sr. FCCA, CFIP, CFC
Auditor General, R.L.

Table of Contents

Procedures and Findings	3
Professional Ethics and Quality Control	7
Responsibilities of the Engaging Party	8
Practitioner's Responsibilities.....	8

ACRONYM

Acronym/Abbreviation/Symbol	Meaning
AA	Administrative Assistant
AG	Auditor General
AWPB	Annual Work Plan and Budget
CFC	Certified Financial Consultant
CFIP	Certified Forensic Investigation Practitioner
COBIT	Control Objectives for Information and Related Technology
COSO	Committee on Sponsoring Organization
CPA	Certified Public Accountant
FC	Financial Comptroller
FCCA	Fellow Member of the Association of Chartered Certified Accountants
GAC	General Auditing Commission
IFAD	International Fund for Agriculture Development
IFR	Interim Financial Reports
ISSAI	International Standards of Supreme Audit Institutions
MFDP	Ministry of Finance and Development Planning
MoA	Ministry of Agriculture
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
NSC	National Steering Committee
PC	Project Coordinator
PFM	Public Financial Management
PIU	Project Implementation Unit
PMU	Project Management Unit
RL	Republic of Liberia
TCEP	Tree Crop Extension Project
US\$	United States Dollars

Republic of Liberia



AUDITOR GENERAL'S REPORT

June 24, 2025

Hon. J. Alexander Nuetah, PHD

Minister

Ministry of Agriculture

Ministerial Complex, Congo Town

Montserrado County, Liberia

We have performed the procedures agreed with IFAD/PIU/PMU and the Ministry of Agriculture and enumerated below with respect to the IFRs Based Disbursement Procedures on the for the Tree Crop Extension Project. Loan Number: 2000000632, ASAP Grant Number: 2000001473, IFAD Additional Loan Number: 2000003091, IFAD DSF Grant Number: 2000003090; RPSF Grant Number: 2000003561 as at December 31, 2024, set forth in the accompanying schedules.

Our report is solely for the purpose of assisting International Fund for Agricultural Development in determining whether the Ministry of Agriculture IFAD Project Implementation Unit's IFR's Based Disbursement is compliant with Term of Reference for the IFAD Projects audit for the period ended December 31, 2024. This report is intended solely for IFAD PIU and the Ministry of Agriculture, and should not be used by, or distributed to any other parties.

The Purpose of this Agreed-Upon Procedure Report is to also determine whether the expenditures claimed through the statement of expenditure (SOE) are outlined in the AWPB and IFR Based Disbursement procedures were properly and appropriately authorized, classified and supported by adequate documentation.

Procedures and Findings

We have performed the procedures described below, which were agreed upon with IFAD MoA PIU in the terms of reference date December 31, 2024, on the IFRs Based Disbursement Procedures.

*Auditor General's Report on the Agreed Upon Procedures on the
Interim Financial Report (IFR) Based Disbursement Procedures for the Tree Crop Extension Project.
For the financial year January 1, 2024 to December 31, 2024*

No.	Procedures	Findings
	Interim Financial Statements	
	Ascertain that the financial management system is reliable to produce the IFRs and has met Fund requirement during the year.	We access the financial management system at the PIU and observed that it is adequate for the production of IFRs. The system met the fund requirement as well.
	Determine whether the expenditures incurred are related to activities outlined in the AWPB and consistent with the grant agreement.	A comparison of figures per activities outlined in the approved AWPB and AWPB figures recorded in the IFRs shows consistencies.
	Determine whether the funds have been utilized for the intended purposes, with due regard to economy, efficiency and social equity.	We observed from our interaction with the intended beneficiaries that the project funds were utilized in due regard to economy, efficiency and value for money.
	Determine whether the threshold was set for the financing instrument and the IFRs prepared accordingly.	We reviewed the financial and administrative manual and all of its amendments. We observed that thresholds were set for the financing instrument.
	Determine their consistency with the annual financial statements.	Comparison of the figures in the IFRs show they were consistent with financial statements figures.
	Determine the reasonableness of the cash flow projections	Comparison of the projected cash forecast and actual cash disbursed revealed that cash flow projection during the period were not reasonable. See Table 1 for details.
	Determine if expenditures incurred are related to the project description in according with the grant agreement.	A comparison of project financing agreement, Statement of Expenditure and IFRs shows that expenditures were in accordance with project description.
	Determine whether the expenditures claimed through IFRs were properly and appropriately authorized, classified and supported by adequate documentation.	Review of the IFRs revealed that expenditures were supported by adequate documents, properly and appropriately authorized and classified for financial reporting
	Identify any ineligible expenditure, including the nature of the ineligible expenditures, the date incurred, and the IFR period.	No ineligible expenditures were identified
	Designated Account	
	Check the accuracy of the Designated Account reconciliation(s).	We observed irregular monthly bank reconciliation of Designated Account of the project. See table 2 for details.
	Confirm that the Designated Account(s) have been maintained in accordance with the provisions of the financing agreement and that transactions from the DA(s) are accurately and correctly recorded in the financial accounts and statements of the project.	A review of the project bank accounts shows that Designated Account have been maintained consistent with the Project financing agreement and transactions were recorded in the financial statements

*Auditor General's Report on the Agreed Upon Procedures on the
Interim Financial Report (IFR) Based Disbursement Procedures for the Tree Crop Extension Project.
For the financial year January 1, 2024 to December 31, 2024*

No.	Procedures	Findings
	Check that expenditures as reported in the project's financial statements are reconciled with the amounts withdrawn from the DA and that the amounts deposited to the DA are reconciled with the amounts disbursed by the Fund.	A review of the SoE, DA and financial statements amount withdrawn and deposited in the DA reconciled to the financial statements.
	Reconciliation should also be made with the amounts paid from the prefinancing account and direct payments (if any).	Test was not possible because the project became effective four (4) years ago.
	Withdrawal Application Statement	
	Confirm that the withdrawal application statement is reconciled with the amounts disbursed by the Fund and deposited to the designated account (DA).	We reviewed the withdrawal application statement and project designated account bank statements. We observed that the amounts withdrawn from the special account were deposited in project designated account.
	Confirm that the withdrawal application statement is reconciled with the IFRs submitted to the Fund.	We reviewed the withdrawal application statement and IFR's submitted for disbursement. We observed that amounts recorded on the withdrawal application were reconciled to the IFRs.
	Ascertain whether the Designated Account currency equivalent was determined using the historical exchange rate of transfers to the operating account or the accounting rules used.	We reviewed the Designated Bank Account statement and the project operation bank account. We observed that Designated Account and project operation account were reported in the same currency (US dollars).
	Determine whether goods and services have been purchased through the SOE mechanism in line with the stipulated SOE threshold.	We reviewed several transactions for the purchase of goods and services. We observed that procurement of goods and services were conducted in accordance with the SOE threshold.
	Determine whether the expenditures claimed through SOE and IFR Based Disbursement procedures were properly and appropriately authorized, classified and supported by audit documentation.	We reviewed the expenditure reports and IFRs. We observed that all expenditures were authorized, classified and supported by documentation.
	Identify any ineligible expenditure.	No ineligible expenditures were identified

Table 1: Cash Forecast and Actual Disbursement Variance

TCEP IFAD LOAN 2000000632	Disbursement Forecast US\$ (A)	Actual Cash Disbursement US\$ (B)	Variance US\$ (C)=A-B	Percentage Variance
Expenditure by CATEGORY				
Civil Works	2,391,652.45	1,279,322.45	1,112,330.00	86.95%
Goods & services	274,241.80	318,927.43	(44,685.63)	-14.01%

*Auditor General's Report on the Agreed Upon Procedures on the
Interim Financial Report (IFR) Based Disbursement Procedures for the Tree Crop Extension Project.
For the financial year January 1, 2024 to December 31, 2024*

Training and workshop	50,000.00	116,336.62	(66,336.62)	-57.02%
Consultancies (and Services)	234,966.75	295,138.26	(60,171.51)	-20.39%
SALARIES AND ALLOWANCES		(71,829.00)	71,829.00	-100.00%
OPERATION COST				
Expenditure by Component				
A. Revitalization of Coca plantation	330,716.80	137,786.83	192,929.97	140.02%
B. Rehabilitation and maintenance	2,076,207.45	1,183,429.77	892,777.68	75.44%
C. service provision for value chain development	378,000.00	218,250.54	159,749.46	73.20%
D. project Coordination momotoring and evaluation	165,966.75	398,428.62	(232,461.87)	-58.34%
TCEP IFAD ADD. LOAN 2000003091	Disbursement Forecast US\$ (A)	Actual Cash Disbursement US\$ (B)	Variance US\$ (C)=A-B	Percentage Variance
Expenditure by CATEGORY				
Civil Works	174,500.00	835,591.59	(661,091.59)	-79.12%
Goods & services	88,887.20		88,887.20	
Training and workshop	22,000.00		22,000.00	
Consultancies (and Services)	123,969.00	10,339.50	113,629.50	1098.98%
SALARIES AND ALLOWANCES			-	
OPERATION COST		2,979.00	(2,979.00)	-100.00%
Expenditure by Component			-	
A. Revitalization of Coca plantation	198,387.20		198,387.20	
B. Rehabilitation and maintenance	88,400.00	846,280.59	(757,880.59)	-89.55%
C. service provision for value chain development	49,294.00		49,294.00	
D. project Coordination momotoring and evaluation	73,275.00	2,979.00	70,296.00	2359.72%
TCEP IFAD GRANT 2000003090	Disbursement Forecast US\$ (A)	Actual Cash Disbursement US\$ (B)	Variance US\$ (C)=A-B	Percentage Variance
Expenditure by CATEGORY				
Civil Works	50,758.11	251,177.67	(200,419.56)	-79.79%
Goods & services	2,500.00	1,358.46	1,141.54	84.03%
Training and workshop			-	
Consultancies (and Services)	17,712.00	5,044.40	12,667.60	251.12%
SALARIES AND ALLOWANCES			-	
OPERATION COST		90.00	(90.00)	-100.00%
Expenditure by Component			-	
A. Revitalization of Coca			-	

*Auditor General's Report on the Agreed Upon Procedures on the
Interim Financial Report (IFR) Based Disbursement Procedures for the Tree Crop Extension Project.
For the financial year January 1, 2024 to December 31, 2024*

plantation				
B. Rehabilitation and maintenance	68,470.11	256,616.57	(188,146.46)	-73.32%
C. service provision for value chain development			-	
D. project Coordination momotoring and evaluation	2,500.00	1,053.96	1,446.04	137.20%
TCEP IFAD GRANT 20000001473	Disbursement Forecast US\$ (A)	Actual Cash Disbursement US\$ (B)	Variance US\$ (C)=A-B	Percentage Variance
Expenditure by CATEGORY				
Civil Works			-	
Goods & services	66,290.00	87,748.91	(21,458.91)	(24.45)
Training and workshop	22,000.00		22,000.00	
Consultancies (and Services)	358,253.50	148,748.39	209,505.11	140.85
SALARIES AND ALLOWANCES			-	
OPERATION COST			-	
Expenditure by Component			-	
A. Revitalization of Coca plantation	213,740.00	204,037.74	9,702.26	4.76
B. Rehabilitation and maintenance	192,187.50		192,187.50	
C. service provision for value chain development		25,215.00	(25,215.00)	(100.00)
D. project Coordination momotoring and evaluation	40,616.00	7,244.56	33,371.44	460.64

Table 2: Designated Accounts Without Monthly Bank Reconciliation Reports

No.	ACCOUNT NAME	ACCOUNT NO	Outstanding Bank Reconciliation Reports for FY 2024
1	TCEPII LOAN ACCOUNT	001160200 3725	January, February, March, April, July, October, November, and December
2	TCEPII GRANT ACCOUNT	001160200 3732	January, February, March, April, July, August, October, November, and December
3	TCEPII Add LOAN ACCOUNT	001150202 4895	January, February, March, April, July, August, September, November, and December
4	TCEPII Add GRANT ACCOUNT	001150202 4905	January, February, March, April, July, August, September, October, November, and December

Professional Ethics and Quality Control

We have complied with the ethical requirements as prescribed by ISSAI 130 and the independence requirements in accordance with ISSAI 130 (34).

General Auditing Commission (GAC) applies International Standard on Quality Control (ISQC) 1, *Quality Control for firms that Perform Audit and Review of Financial Statements, and Other Assurance and Related Services Engagements*, and accordingly, maintains a comprehensive system

of quality control including documented policies and procedures regarding compliance with ethical requirements, professional standards and applicable legal and regulatory requirements.

Responsibilities of the Engaging Party

IFAD PIU has acknowledged that the agreed-upon procedures are appropriate for the purpose of the engagement.

IFAD PIU (also the Responsible Party) is responsible for the subject matter on which the agreed-upon procedures are performed.

Practitioner's Responsibilities

We have conducted the agreed-upon procedures engagement in accordance with the International Standard on Related Services (ISRS) 4400 (Revised), Agreed-Upon Procedures Engagements. An agreed-upon procedures engagement involves our performing the procedures that have been agreed with the Engaging Party, and reporting the findings, which are the factual results of the agreed-upon procedures performed. We make no representation regarding the appropriateness of the agreed-upon procedures.

This agreed-upon procedures engagement is not an assurance engagement. Accordingly, we do not express an opinion or an assurance conclusion.

Had we performed additional procedures, other matters might have come to our attention that would have been reported.

P. Garswa Jackson Sr. FCCA, CFIP, CFC
Auditor General, R.L.

May 2025