



Promoting Accountability of Public Resources

AUDITOR GENERAL'S REPORT

On the Audit of the Micro-Small Medium Enterprises Project

For the period February
2012 to December 2015



May 2016

Yusador S. Gaye, CPA, CGMA
Auditor General, RL

Table of Contents

1.1	Management's Responsibility.....	4
1.2	Auditor's Responsibility.....	4
1.3	Basis for Adverse Conclusion	5
1.4	Adverse Conclusion.....	6
2	BACKGROUND	6
2.1	Background of the MSME Project.....	7
2.2	Audit Objectives.....	8
2.3	Audit Methodology.....	8
2.4	Limitation of Responsibility.....	8
3	DETAILED FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	9
3.1	Financial Issues	9
3.1.1	Payments without Adequate Supporting Documentation	9
3.1.2	Payments to Third Party	10
3.1.3	Petty Cash Funds	11
3.1.4	Deposits Made into the MSME Project's Account.....	12
3.1.5	Bank reconciliation	13
3.1.6	Payments outside the Project Scope	14
3.2	Compliance issues.....	15
3.2.1	Safeguarding of Assets	15
3.2.2	Procurement Plan.....	16
3.2.3	Payment not in Line with PPCC Act	17
3.2.4	Withholding of Goods and Services Tax (GST) from Vendors.....	18
3.2.5	Policies and Procedures	19
3.2.6	Project Supervision.....	19
4	ACKNOWLEDGEMENT.....	21
	APPENDIX.....	22

Acronyms/Abbreviations/Symbols

Acronyms/Abbreviations/Symbol	Meaning
A/C#	Account Number
AG	Auditor General
BEP	Bid Evaluation Panel
CBL	Central Bank of Liberia
CGMA	Chartered Global Management Accountant
COSO	Committee of Sponsoring Organizations of the Treadway Commission
CPA	Certified Public Accountant
CVF	Counterpart Value Fund
FIB	First International Bank
GAC	General Auditing Commission
GoL	Government of Liberia
GSM	Global System for Mobile
GST	Goods and Services Tax
INTOSAI	International Organization of Supreme Audit Institutions
ISSAI	International Standards of Supreme Audit Institutions
L\$	Liberian Dollars
LBR	Liberia Business Registry
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
MoCI	Ministry of Commerce & Industry
MOU	Memorandum of Understanding
MSC	Ministerial Steering Committee
MSME	Micro-Small Medium Enterprise
PFM Act	Public Finance Management Act
PPC Act	Public Procurement Concession Act
PPCC	Public Procurement and Concession Committee
PVs	Payment Vouchers
ToR	Terms of Reference
TWG	Technical Working Group
US\$	United States Dollar
WHT	Withholding Taxes

Compliance Report on the Micro-Small Medium Enterprise (MSME) Project of the Ministry of Commerce and Industry for the period February 12, 2012 to December 30, 2015.

We have audited the activities and financial transactions of the Micro-Small Medium Enterprises (MSMEs) Project of the Ministry of Commerce and Industry compliance with relevant laws and regulations for the period ended December 30, 2015 consistent with the Auditor General's mandate as provided for in Section 2.1.3 of the General Auditing Commission (GAC) Act of 2014 as well as the Audit Engagement Terms of Reference (ToR).

1.1 Management's Responsibility

Management is responsible for the preparation of a complete project accounts in accordance with the terms of the project agreement and stated laws and regulations.

This audit was conducted on the basis or understanding that the Management of the MSME Project of the Ministry of Commerce and Industry has the responsibility to establish and maintain internal controls necessary to:

- Enable it undertake its contracts award, goods delivery, projects execution, evaluation and reporting in an effective and efficient manner as well as the preparation of documentation on the procurement/projects that are free from material misstatements whether due to fraud or error and in compliance with authorities that govern them;
- Provide reasonable assurance that adopted policies and prescribed procedures are adhered to and errors and irregularities, including fraud and illegal acts are prevented or detected; and to provide us with access to the following:
- All information of which the Ministry of Commerce and Industry Management is aware of that is relevant to its contracts award, goods delivery, projects execution, evaluation and reporting as well as their related documentation;
- Any additional information that we may request from Management for the purposes of the review; and
- Unrestricted access to persons within the Ministry from whom we determine it necessary to obtain review evidence.

1.2 Auditor's Responsibility

Our responsibility is to independently express a conclusion on the financial records of the MSME Project based on our audit. Our work was conducted in accordance with the International Organization of Supreme Audit Institutions (INTOSAI), Fundamental Auditing Principles (FAP) and Guidelines for Compliance Audit (GCA). Those principles

require that we comply with ethical requirements and plan and perform the audit so as to obtain reasonable assurance as to whether the use of MSME Funded Project are in compliance, in all material respects, with the funding agreement dated February 2012 as well as stated laws and regulations.

An audit involves performing procedures to obtain sufficient appropriate evidence to support our conclusion. The procedures performed depend on the auditor's professional judgment, including assessing the risk of material non-compliance, whether due to fraud or error. The audit procedures performed are those we believe are appropriate in the circumstances. We believe that the audit evidence gathered is sufficient and appropriate to provide the basis for our conclusion.

1.3 Basis for Adverse Conclusion

It was observed during the conduct of the audit that the MSME Project Management made payments for various transactions amounting to Twenty-Seven Thousand One Hundred Ninety-Nine United States Dollars (**US\$27,199.00**) without adequate supporting documentation to substantiate the regularity of the transactions.

It was observed during the conduct of the audit that MSME Project Management made Payments amounting to Twenty-Five Thousand Three Hundred Ten United States Dollars (**US\$25,310.00**) for various goods and services in the names of employees of the Ministry of Commerce and Industry (MoCI)/MSME Fund Project, rather than in the names of the vendors providing those goods and services.

It was observed during the audit that several deposits in the amount of Sixty-Thousand One Hundred Thirty-Two United States Dollars (**US\$60,132.00**) were made to the MSME Project's Account number (00.112-005309-01) for the periods under audit. The only source of any deposits into the project account should be from the Counterpart Value Fund at the Central Bank of Liberia, or through a special provision.

It was observed during the conduct of the audit that an amount of Fifty-Five Thousand Six-Hundred Fifty-Six United States Dollars and Eighty-Eight Cents (**US\$55,656.88**) designated for use by the MSME Project was disbursed to other MoCI activities, including Domestic Subsistence Allowances (DSAs), and procurement of non-project related goods and services without consideration of the MSME's budgetary allocation or approved project plan.

1.4 Adverse Conclusion

Based on the audit work performed, we found that, because of the significance of the matters noted in the Basis for the Adverse Conclusion paragraphs above, the activities and financial transactions of MSME Project are not in compliance, in all material respects, with stated laws and regulations.


**Yusador S. Gaye CPA, CGMA
Auditor General, R.L**

**Monrovia, Liberia
May 2016**

2 BACKGROUND

2.1 Background of the MSME Project

In 2008, immediately preceding the global financial meltdown, economies experienced an intermittent upsurge in the prices of cash crops, particularly rice, Liberia's major staple. Cognizant of the political and economic importance of rice and the need to ensure food security for Liberia, President Ellen Johnson engaged in bilateral consultation with the Government of Japan and requested Food Aid Assistance. The Japanese Commodity Grants Monetization and Counterpart Value Funding Projects derived from these bilateral consultations.

The primary purpose of the Japanese Commodity Grants Monetization and Counterpart Value Funding program is to aid socio-economic development programs in Liberia. Funding for projects is derived from two funds sources, Food Aid (rice) and Non- Project Grant (petroleum). The primary activities of the monetization programs are the purchase and subsequent sale, at a discount, of commodities (i.e. rice and petroleum). In essence the commodities are converted (i.e. monetized) to liquidity/money. The proceeds from the monetization program are initially deposited at the Central Bank of Liberia then subsequently deploy into the Liberian economy to fund approved socioeconomic development projects.

On March 2011 the Government of Liberia adopted the Micro-Small Medium Enterprise for the establishment of a new MSME Division at the Ministry of Commerce and Industry financed with the Counterpart value Funds deposited into the Central Bank of Liberia under the Japanese Non-profit Grant Aid.

During the period under review, MSME Management as per the bank statement received an initial amount of Eight Hundred Eighty-One Thousand Ninety-Seven United States Dollars (**US\$881,097.00**) in its United State Dollars Account No. 00.112-005308-01 as part of the project finance with the Counterpart Value Funds deposited under the Japanese Non Pro Grant Aid. Subsequent deposits amounting to Forty-Five Thousand Eight Hundred United States Dollars (**US\$45,800.00**) were made into the MSME's Project account from other sources. The Project Management as per the said bank statement disbursed a total amount of Nine Hundred Three Thousand Three Hundred Fifty Five United States Dollars and Seventy Four Cents (**US\$903,355.74**) resulting in an adjusted closing balance of Twenty Three Thousand Five Hundred Forty One United States Dollars and Twenty Six Cents (US\$23,541.26) as at December 31, 2015.

For the periods under audit, MoCI/MSME Project had the following management personnel who handled the administrative and financial affairs of the project:

Table 1: Key Personnel

No	Name	Position	Tenure
1	Hon. Miata Beysolow	Minister	2008 to 2013
2	Hon. Axel M. Addy	Minister	2013 to Present
3	Hon. Andrew G. Paygar	Deputy Minister for Small Business Adm.	2015 to Present
4	Hon. Daniel Dean	Asst. Minister for Administration	2013 to Present
5	Mr. Filiman S. Sanyon	Comptroller	2008 to Present
6	Steve Flahn Paye	Coordinator for Japanese Funding Project	2008 to Present

2.2 Audit Objectives

The main objective of the audit is to gather sufficient appropriate audit evidence to conclude whether the activities and financial information of the MoCI/MSME Project for the period February 2012 to December 2015 are in compliance, in all material respects with policies, procedures, applicable laws, regulations, and are free of material errors.

2.3 Audit Methodology

The audit was conducted in accordance with International Organization of Supreme Audit Institutions (INTOSAI), Fundamental Auditing Principles and Guidelines for Compliance Audit. Those standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain reasonable assurance that the financial information provided by the Ministry of Commerce & Industry MSME Project management is in compliance, in all material respects with policies, procedures, applicable laws, regulations, and are free of material errors. In furtherance of this, we undertook audit procedures as would enable us to attain the above objectives.

Our audit also took cognizance of the requirements under the Auditor General's mandate as spelt out under Sections 2.1.9 of the GAC Act of 2014. Our audit approach included observation, inquiries, inspections, re-performance, confirmation, and analytical procedures on areas we considered as high risk.

2.4 Limitation of Responsibility

We reviewed the systems and management controls operated by the Ministry of Commerce and Industry MSME Project only to the extent we considered necessary for the effective conduct of this audit. As a result, our review may not have detected all weaknesses that existed or all improvements that could be made.

3 DETAILED FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

3.1 Financial Issues

3.1.1 Payments without Adequate Supporting Documentation

Observation

3.1.1.1 P.9 (2) of the Public Financial Management (PFM) Regulations of 2009 states that "Payments except for statutory transfers and debt service shall be supported by invoices, bills and other documents in addition to the payment vouchers".

3.1.1.2 It was observed during the conduct of the audit that the MSME Project Management made payments for various transactions amounting to One-Hundred Four Thousand Five Hundred Forty-Three United States Dollars and Twenty-One Cents (US\$104,543.21) without adequate supporting documentation to substantiate the regularity of the transactions. **(Refer to Appendix 1 for details).**

Risk

3.1.1.3 Payments without adequate supporting documentation could cast doubt on the regularity of the transactions and undermine public sector accountability and transparency.

Recommendation

3.1.1.4 The Management of the MSME Project should provide the necessary supporting documentation for the total of **US\$104,543.21** expended without supporting documents.

Management's Response

3.1.1.5 *The transactions vouchers and other supporting documentations are provided in two Box Folders marked (Box 1 & Box 2). These documents were provided earlier. Following your observation, we have arranged the supporting documents in the two boxes according to appendix 1 of your report.*

Auditor General's Position

3.1.1.6 The document provided by the MSME Project Management could only support **US\$77,344.21** out of the total amount of **US\$104,543.21** thereby, leaving a variance of **US\$27,199.00** without supporting documents. **Refer to Appendix 1 for details.**

3.1.1.7 Failure to provide the supporting documents for the variance of **US\$27,199.00** is a breach of financial discipline as provided for by the PFM Regulation of 2009 Section A.20. Therefore, we have adjusted our recommendation for the MSME Project Management to be made to account for the variance.

3.1.2 Payments to Third Party

Observation

3.1.2.1 B. 28 of the PFM Regulations of 2009 states that "A payment shall be made only to the person or persons named on the payment voucher or to their representatives duly and legally authorized in writing to receive the payment".

3.1.2.2 It was observed during the conduct of the audit that the MSME Project Management made payments amounting to Twenty-Five Thousand Three Hundred Ten United States Dollars **(US\$25,310.00)** for various goods and services in the names of the Accountant and other employees of the Ministry of Commerce and Industry (MoCI)/MSME Fund Project, rather than in the names of the vendors providing those goods and services. **(Refer to Table 1 below for payments to third party).**

Table 1: Payments to Third Party

No.	Date	Payee	Description	Check No.	Amount (US\$)
1	Oct 25, 2012	Frederick C. Yagbah	Payment for press coverage (Monrovia Based Journalist) for one day workshop for carpenters, Welders, chain sawyer & wood dealers in Monrovia sponsored by MSME.	000478816	210.00
2	May 6, 2013	Frederick C. Yagbah	Payment as compensation to artists for performing at MSME program	000484622	500.00
3	May 8, 2013	Frederick C. Yagbah	Payment to journalists for press coverage	000484624	650.00
4	April 26, 2013	Frederick C. Yagbah	Payment as honorarium for Ushers, security officers and artists and the 2013 conference of MSME	000484618	2,250.00
5	Jan 15, 2014	Frederick C. Yagbah	Payment for renovation works at the MSME Division due to the President visit at MOCI	2206742	2,000.00
6	April 25, 14	Frederick C. Yagbah	Payment as honorarium for the Second National MSME Conference, 2014	2240305	6,500.00
7	Nov. 16, 2015	Julius Y. Saye keh - Nel	Payment as additional request for media coverage and other sundry expenses associated to the MSME National Conference scheduled for November 17-18,2015	2323234	1,000.00
8	April 16, 2012	Julius Y. Saye Kernel	Payment for talk shows, town hall meetings and others for county tour	000430998	10,200.00
9	Nov 17, 2015	Mitchel Jones	Payment as press coverage for the MSME National conference	2323241	1,000.00

No.	Date	Payee	Description	Check No.	Amount (US\$)
10	Nov 20, 2015	Mitchel Jones	Payment as press coverage for the MSME National conference	2323242	1,000.00
		TOTAL			25,310.00

Risk

- 3.1.2.3 Payments in name of employees of MoCI for the procurement of goods and services could lead to misapplication/misappropriation of the Project's funds.

Recommendation

- 3.1.2.4 The Management of the MSME Project should provide substantive justifications for authorizing payments in the names of the MoCI/MSME Project Accountant and other employees of MoCI instead of the concerned vendors.

Management's Response

- 3.1.2.5 *The circumstances and urgency at the time necessitated these authorizations which were made in Good Faith, the intended second parties received their money as evidence by the attached receipts to voucher numbers 4205, 5274 and 4804. Only US\$210 payment to second party receipt was not found*

Auditor General's Position

- 3.1.2.6 Going forward, all payments should be made in the name of Vendors/Suppliers of goods and Services. Therefore, we maintain our recommendation.

3.1.3 Petty Cash Funds

Observation

- 3.1.3.1 B.33 (4) of the PFM Regulations of 2009 states that "the maximum amount that may be held as petty cash in any one calendar month is the equivalent of United States Dollars Two Hundred".
- 3.1.3.2 It was observed during the conduct of the audit that the MSME Management exceeded the petty cash threshold established by the PFM Regulations of 2009 by One-Thousand Six-Hundred Eighty-Three United States Dollars and Seventy Cents **(US\$1,683.70)**. **(Refer to Appendix 2 for details)**.

Risk

- 3.1.3.3 Exceeding the petty cash threshold established by the PFM Regulations is a violation. Additionally, exceeding the petty cash threshold could lead to the misappropriation of the Project's Funds.

Recommendation

- 3.1.3.4 The MSME Project Management should provide justification for exceeding the petty cash

threshold established by the PFM Regulations.

Management's Response

- 3.1.3.5 *The amounts represented the actual petty cash need of the MSME Project to facility its daily operations efficiently and effectively.*

Auditor General's Position

- 3.1.3.6 Management assertion is not backed by any documentary evidence. Therefore, the MSME Management should be held accountable for the PFM violation.

3.1.4 Deposits Made into the MSME Project's Account

Observation

- 3.1.4.1 H.9 (5) of the PFM Regulations of 2009 states that "Private money shall not be deposited into an official bank account, except in accordance with the provisions of an enactment relating to money held in trust for other persons or bodies; nor shall state money be paid into a private bank account".

- 3.1.4.2 It was observed during the audit that several deposits in the amount of Sixty-Thousand One-Hundred Thirty-Two United States Dollars (**US\$60,132.00**) were made to the MSME Project's Account number (00.112-005309-01) for the periods under audit. The only source of any deposits into the project account should have been from the Counterpart Value Fund at the Central Bank of Liberia, or through a special provision. **(See Table 2 below for details)**

Table 2: Deposits made into the MSME Project's Account

Date	Depositor	Description	Deposit Ref.	Amount (US\$)
June 8-12	Frederick	Slip # 46408 dep-by-frederick	01522191	\$350.00
May 15-13	Unknown	Cbl chq#76619 issued by ministry 076619	01929639	\$300.00
May 7-14	Unknown	Acb chq#009058 ifo-micro small an009058	02372096	\$5,000.00
May 7-14	Unknown	Uba chq#00156312 ifo-ministry of c156312	02372106	\$2,000.00
May 7-14	Unknown	458836 ifo-ministry of commerce	02372113	\$2,500.00
May 7-14	Unknown	g.t. bank chq#00014815 ifo-ministry 014815	02372117	\$800.00
May 21-14	Frederick C. Yagba	Slip#110335 dep Frederick c yagba	02387778	\$1,500.00
Jul 11-14	F.C. Yagbah	Dep-f.c. yagbah	454957	\$100.00
Jul 22-14	F.C. Yagbah	Cash deposit by F.C. Yagbah	465929	\$30.00
Sep 1-14	Unknown	ECOBANK chq#2524251 IFO MS 2524251	02509700	\$500.00
Nov 24-14	Unknown	Afril chq#155453 ifo micro small me 155453	02599921	\$5,000.00
Dec 16-14	Samuel Jac	Fib chq# 2236517 wdl by Samuel jac	02624408	\$1,080.00
Jan 6-15	Unknown	ECOBANK chq#36560 IFO MSME036560	02648493	\$5,000.00
Feb 26-15	Pewee S Reed	Cash dep by pewee s reed	02713633	\$3,000.00

Date	Depositor	Description	Deposit Ref.	Amount (US\$)
Mar 30-15	Pewee S Reed	Cash dep by pewee s reed	02752181	\$600.00
Apr 14-15	Frederick C Yagboh	Cash dep by Frederick c Yagboh	02773009	\$4,000.00
Apr 22-15	Unknown	Fibchq#2023029 issued to msme pr	02781722	\$600.00
May27-15	Unknown	Fib chq#2023032 ifo msme project	02823387	\$600.00
Jun 29-15	Unknown	Cash Dep by MSME Project	02866362	\$1,562.00
Oct 27-15	Unknown	Fibchq#2297005 ifo msemi project	03029381	\$5,000.00
Nov 11-15	Unknown	ECOBANKCHQ# 00212664 issued by 212664	03046156	\$2,000.00
Nov 11-15	Unknown	GBL CHQ#0000206 IFO MSME PR 002062	03046168	\$1,000.00
Nov 13-15	Unknown	LBDI chq#10456 ifo MSME Project 010456	03049495	\$5,000.00
Nov 13-15	Unknown	LBDI chq# 122232 issued by Premi122232	03049511	\$2,500.00
Nov 16-15	Unknown	ECOB CHQ#80037622 IFO MSME 80037622	03052167	\$5,000.00
Nov 24-15	Unknown	LBDI chq#162160 issued by Liberia 162160	03061542	\$5,000.00
Dec 2-15	Harry W Boway	Cash dep by Harry W Boway	03072441	\$110.00
		TOTAL		60,132.00

Risk

- 3.1.4.3 The project's account could be used for personal transactions thus leading to the misapplication or misappropriation of the Project's Funds.

Recommendation

- 3.1.4.4 The MSME Project Management should provide substantive justification for the deposits made into the Project's Account other than the Counterpart Value fund or special provision.

Management's Response

- 3.1.4.5 *The deposits made into the MSME Project account were all project related, most of which were from various donors contributions for the MSME Annual National Conferences. These donations were not private money.*

Auditor General's Position

- 3.1.4.6 The MSME Management's explanation is no justification for not adhering to the PFM Regulation of 2009. Therefore, the MSME Management should be held accountable for the breach of the PFM Regulation.

3.1.5 Bank reconciliation

Observation

- 3.1.5.1 Part R, R.3 (6) of the PFM Regulations of 2009 states that "the balance of every bank account as shown in a bank statement shall be reconciled with the corresponding cashbook balance at least one every month; and the reconciliation statement shall be filed or recorded in the cash book or the reference to the date and number thereof."

3.1.5.2 It was observed during the conduct of the audit that MSME Project Management did not prepare any bank reconciliation for the period February 2012 to December, 2012.

Risk

3.1.5.3 Failure to prepare bank reconciliation statements could lead to untimely detection of errors or omission in the financial processes.

Recommendation

3.1.5.4 The MSME Project Management should ensure that all bank reconciliations are prepared on time, signed by designated staff, reviewed and approved by a superior officer on a monthly basis.

Management's Response

3.1.5.5 *Noted and will be implemented as recommended.*

Auditor General's Position

We acknowledge Management's acceptance of our finding. However, we will make a follow-up on the implementation of the audit recommendation.

3.1.6 **Payments outside the Project Scope**

Observation

3.1.6.1 E.16 (1) of the PFM Regulations of 2009 states that "a head of government agency may not authorize payment to be made out of funds earmarked for specific activities for purposes other than those activities."

3.1.6.2 It was observed during the conduct of the audit that an amount of Fifty-Five Thousand Six-Hundred Fifty-Six United States Dollars and Eighty-Eight Cents (**US\$55,656.88**) designated for use by the MSME Project was disbursed to other MoCI activities, including Domestic Subsistence Allowances (DSAs), and procurement of non-project related goods and services without consideration of the MSME's budgetary allocation or approved project plan. (**Refer to Appendix 3 for details**).

Risk

3.1.6.3 Payments made outside the project's scope could lead to non-achievement of the project's objectives.

Recommendation

3.1.6.4 The MSME Management should provide justification for expending the project's funds on activities that were not earmarked by the Project's Utilization Plan.

Management's Response

3.1.6.5 *We could not anticipate all of the activities for inclusion in the Project Utilization Plan, however, all other expenditures, domestic and international travels were duly approved*

by authorities at the Ministry and that all of the expenditures were MSME related

Auditor General's Position

- 3.1.6.6 Disbursement made outside MoCI/MSME Project funds without any written policy and Ministerial Steering Committee rules and regulations available to substantiate the funds drawn out of the MSME Project's account undermines the approved budget breakdown for the use of counterpart value funds. Therefore, the MSME Management should be held accountable for the breach of the PFM Regulation.

3.2 Compliance issues

3.2.1 Safeguarding of Assets

Observation

- 3.2.1.1 V.1 (2a & b) of the PFM Regulations of 2009 states that "The Head of Government Agency must take full responsibility of assets assigned to him by the General Services Agency and ensure that proper control systems exist for assets and that:(a) preventive mechanisms are in place to eliminate theft, losses, wastage and misuse; And (b) inventory levels are at an optimum and economical level".

- 3.2.1.2 It was observed during the conduct of the audit that some assets were not available for physical verification. Further examination revealed instances in which assets purchased by the project management were not properly recorded in the fixed assets listing i.e. information such as date of acquisition, cost of assets, departmental code, depreciation expense, were not included on the register. As a result of these deviations noted, we could not provide assurance on whether the MoCI/MSME's Assets have been properly safeguarded and accurately disclosed. **(Refer to Appendix 4 for details).**

Risk

- 3.2.1.3 The Fixed Assets of the Project could be susceptible to theft in the absence of the codification of the assets. Also assets not physically verified could be converted to personal use.

Recommendation

- 3.2.1.4 The MSME Project Management should provide the one laptop, an IBEX projector to the GAC for physical verification and should ensure that the fixed assets of the Project are properly coded.

Management's Response

- 3.2.1.5 *The projector in question was not an asset of the MSME Project but IBEX. It was on loan from IBEX and has been returned. Some of the assets were spoiled, disposed of without documentation.*

Auditor General's Position

- 3.2.1.6 Management assertion is not backed by any documentary evidence. Therefore, MSME Management should be held accountable for the projector and Laptop.

3.2.2 Procurement Plan

Observation

- 3.2.2.1 Section 40 (1) of the Amended and Restated Public Procurement and Concessions Act of 2010, states that "All Procuring Entities shall undertake Procurement planning, with a view to achieving maximum value for public expenditure and the other objects of this Act".
- 3.2.2.2 Subsection 2, further states that: "For each fiscal year the Procurement Unit shall prepare a draft annual procurement Plan for goods, works and services for use by the procuring Entity in procuring Entity's budgeting process. Upon budget approval, the procurement Unit shall prepare an annual procurement plan for good, works and services in accordance with the procuring Entity's approved programs and budget and furnish it to the Procurement Committee."
- 3.2.2.3 It was observed during the conduct of the audit, that the project management team did not provide a procurement plan for our examination. Consequently, we were unable to ascertain whether a procurement plan was developed for the procurement of goods, services and works hence we don't know whether the basis on which goods, services and works were procured were in line with the PPC Act of 2010 and the enabling regulations.

Risk

- 3.2.2.4 The lack of Procurement Plan could lead to discretionary procurement and undermine value for money.

Recommendation

- 3.2.2.5 The Project Management Team should provide an approved procurement plan that is in compliance with the Public Procurement Concessions Act.

Management's Response

- 3.2.2.6 *The MSME Project Management did not produce a procurement plan, however, the purchase of goods, services and works was based on the approved project budget.*

Auditor General's Position

- 3.2.2.7 PPCC Regulations requires that the purchase of goods, services, and works be based on an approved procurement plan. The intent of the Amended and Restated Public Procurement and Concessions Act of 2010 regarding procurement planning is with a view to achieving maximum value for public expenditure. Therefore, we maintain our recommendation.

3.2.3 **Payment not in Line with PPCC Act**

Observation

3.2.3.1 Section 46 (1) of the Amended and Restated Public Procurement and Concessions Act of 2010 stipulates that "public procurement shall be undertaken by means of advertised open bid proceedings, that to which equal access shall be provided to all eligible and qualified bidders without discrimination, subject only to the exceptions provided under this par for a particular methods of procurement." 46 (2) stipulates that "it is not permitted artificially to subdivide procurement with intention of avoiding the applicability of the thresholds to procurement. 46 (3) stipulates that "procurement entities may use only those methods of procurement authorized by this Act. If a procuring Entity use a method of procurement other than advertised open competitive bidding, it shall note in the record of the procurement method".

3.2.3.2 It was observed during the conduct of the audit that the Project management team made payment in the amount of Forty-three Thousand One-Hundred Twenty United States Dollars **(US\$43,120.00)** to United Motor Company for a vehicle, and another payment in the amount of Fifty-Nine Thousand Five Hundred Five United States Dollars, and Sixty-Four Cents **(US\$59,505.64)** to Super Petroleum Company, and Aminata & Sons Inc. for fuel/gas purchases without using National Competitive Bidding (NCB) method as prescribed in the **PPCC Act of 2010**.

Risk

3.2.3.3 This could undermine the value for money and could lead to the undermining of the project's objectives.

Recommendation

3.2.3.4 The Management team should provide material justification for not conforming to the PPCC Act in the Procurement of the various goods.

Management's Response

3.2.3.5 *The vendors mentioned (United Motors Company, super Petroleum Company and Aminata & Sons Inc.) were selected under the approved MoCI procurement in accordance with the PPCC Law. However we note the observation that prior approval from PPCC should have been obtained for the legally selected vendors for this project which falls under MoCI*

Auditor General's Position

3.2.3.6 MSME Management should be held accountable for the PPCC violation.

3.2.3.7 We acknowledge Management's acceptance of our finding. However, we will make a follow-up on the implementation of the audit recommendation.

3.2.4 Withholding of Goods and Services Tax (GST) from Vendors

Observation

3.2.4.1 Section 905 (J) of the Revenue Code of Liberia Act of 2000 and Amended Version of 2010 stipulates "within 10 days after the last day of the month, a payer described in (a) is required to remit to the tax authorities the total amount required to be withheld during that month", and (m) stipulates "a person who has a withholding obligation under this section and fails to withhold and remit the amount of tax required to be withheld is subject to section 52 penalty for late payment and failure to pay".

3.2.4.2 It was observed during the conduct of the audit that MoCI/MSME Project Management did not withhold and remit into Government of Liberia Revenue account the amount of Eight-Thousand Six-Hundred Thirty United States Dollars and Thirty-Five Cents (**US\$8,630.35**) representing taxes withheld from various vendors for the procurement of goods, services, and works. **(See Table 4 below for details)**

Table: 4 Withholding of Goods and Services Tax (GST) Deduction

Item	Amount in (US\$)	GST Tax Rate	GOL GST Tax Amt (US\$)	Comments
Fuel & Lubricants	59,505.64	0.04	2,380.23	No GOL GST tax deduction, no sales contract
Scratch cards	22,042.00	0.04	881.68	No GOL GST tax deduction, no sales contract
Foreign Travels	4,702.16	0.02	94.04	No GOL GST tax deduction,
Fixed Assets	98,818.20	0.04	3,952.73	No GOL GST tax deduction,
Repair & Maintenance	3,040.99	0.02	60.82	No GOL GST tax deduction,
Entertainment	63,042.57	0.02	1,260.85	No GOL GST tax deduction,
TOTAL	251,151.56		8,630.35	

Risk

3.2.4.3 Failure to deduct and remit withholding taxes could deny Government of needed Tax Revenue.

Recommendation

3.2.4.4 The MoCI/MSME Project Management should ensure that all withheld taxes are remitted timely to GoL Revenue Account. Additionally, the associated interest and penalties should be computed and remitted to GoL Revenue Account.

Management's Response

3.2.4.5 *The project Management did not withhold taxes on the purchases of goods and services for the period audited from vendors because the practice of withholding and remitting taxes was not institutionalized by government ministries and agencies. Currently the Ministry faces serious challenge when it comes to withholding taxes as most vendors usually supply the net value for goods or services paid for.*

Auditor General's Position

- 3.2.4.6 The MSME Management's explanation is no justification for not adhering to the Revenue Code of Liberia. Therefore, the MSME Management should be held accountable for the breach of the Revenue Code Section 905(J).

3.2.5 Policies and Procedures

Observations

- 3.2.5.1 The Committee of Sponsoring Organizations of the Tread way Commission (COSO) internal control framework on control activities stipulates that "institutions deploy control activities through policies that establish what is expected and procedures that put policies into action". Policies and procedures are established and implemented to help ensure that risk responses are effectively carried out within an entity.

- 3.2.5.2 It was observed during the conduct of the audit that the MSME Project Management had no guidance on the procedures for distributing gasoline & scratch cards to staff of MSME Project/MoCI and the petty cash fund.

Risk

- 3.2.5.3 The lack of policy to regulate the distribution of gasoline & scratch cards to staff and the usage of petty cash could lead to discretionary distribution of gasoline & scratch cards and usage of petty cash.

Recommendation

- 3.2.5.4 The MSME Project Management should ensure that policies are put in place to guide the distribution of gasoline & scratch cards and the usage of petty cash.

Management's Response

- 3.2.5.5 *Noted and will be implemented as recommended*

Auditor General's Position

- 3.2.5.6 We acknowledge Management's acceptance of our finding. However, we will make a follow-up on the implementation of the audit recommendation.

3.2.6 Project Supervision

Observation

- 3.2.6.1 A.15 (1) of the PFM Regulations of 2009 States that "a head of government agency must exercise all reasonable care to prevent and detect unauthorized, irregular, fruitless, and wasteful expenditure, and must for this purpose implement clearly defined business processes, identify risk associated with these processes and institute effective internal control to mitigate these risks.

- 3.2.6.2 It was observed during the conduct of the audit that the implementation of the MSME Project appears not to have been regularly monitored by the Ministry of Commerce and Industry and the other significant monitoring partners.

Risk

- 3.2.6.3 The lack of supervision over the implementation of Project could lead to none achievement of the project's objectives.

Recommendation

- 3.2.6.4 The MoCI/MSME Project Management should ensure regular supervision over the implementation of the Project.

Management's Response

- 3.2.6.5 *Noted and will be implemented as recommended.*

Auditor General's Position

- 3.2.6.6 We acknowledge Management's acceptance of our finding. However, we will make a follow-up on the implementation of the audit recommendation.

4 ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

- 4.1 We acknowledge the cooperation and assistance provided to the GAC Audit Team by the Management and staff of MSME/Ministry of Commerce and Industry during the course of the audit. The efforts and commitments of GAC staff in conducting this audit are also gracefully acknowledged.


Yusador S. Gaye CPA, CGMA
Auditor General, R.L

Monrovia, Liberia
May, 2016

APPENDIX

APPENDIX 1 Payments without Adequate Supporting Documentation

Date	Vendor/Payee	Description	Check No.	Amount (US\$)	Missing Document
Oct 25-12	Frederick C. Yagbah	Payment for press coverage (Monrovia Based Journalist) for one day workshop for carpenters, welders, chainsaw, and wood dealers in Monrovia sponsored by MSME.	000478816	210.00	No Receipt
April 17- 12	Figure Restaurant	Payment for catering services	46156	850.00	No Delivery Note
Feb 5-15	Cross Words	Payment for the purchase of assorted equipment and supplies for the MSME Division	2320819	8,900.00	No Delivery Note
Sept 17-13	Samuel W. Jacobs	Payment as incidental allowance for Samuel W. Jacobs to Nairobi, Kenya	2206653	350.00	No Retirement
Nov 25-13	Joseph Tamba	Payment as incidental allowance to attend a training course in development of SMEs in South Korea	2206294	550.00	No Retirement
Nov 25-13	Richard Pratt	Payment as incidental allowance to attend a training course in development of SMEs in South Korea	2206295	550.00	No Retirement
Nov 25-13	Orlance Bracewell	Payment as incidental allowance to attend a training course in development of SMEs in South Korea	2206293	550.00	No Retirement
Nov 25-13	Refus Kakar	Payment as incidental allowance to attend a training course in development of SMEs in South Korea	2206292	550.00	No Retirement
Nov 25-13	Edna Bropleh	Payment as incidental allowance to attend a training course in development of SMEs in South Korea	2206291	550.00	No Retirement
Nov 25-13	Victoria K. Nyanquoi	Payment as incidental allowance to attend a training course in development of SMEs in South Korea	2206290	550.00	No Retirement
Nov 25-13	Emmanuel Kapee	Payment as incidental allowance to attend a training course in development of SMEs in South Korea	2206289	550.00	No Retirement
Nov 25-13	Samuel W.	Payment as incidental	2206288		No Retirement

Date	Vendor/Payee	Description	Check No.	Amount (US\$)	Missing Document
	Jacobs	allowance to attend a training course in development of SMEs in South Korea		550.00	
April 2-14	P. Momo Sesay, Jr.	Payment of Incidental allowance for travel to Japan	2240281	1,075.00	No Receipt
May 8, 2014	Christopher Kennedy	Payment as incidental allowance for Christopher Kennedy	2240296	975.00	No Retirement
Aug 7-14	Baker Tilly Auditing Firm	Payment as represents audit fees to the Baker Tilly Auditing Firm for auditing the financial statements of the EIF/NIU for the period January to December 2012	2245917	3,509.00	Outside of the Project
Feb 3-15	Harbel Supermarket	Payment for the purchase of 96pcs of scratch cards for the MSME Division covering June 2015	2320813	480.00	No receipt and delivery note.
June 19-15	Julius Y. Saye - Keh nel	payment as incidental allowance for Mr. Julius Saye Keh - Nel to attend the Expert meeting on the Draft ECOWAS Small and Medium Enterprises (SMEs) strategy & ECOWAS SME Chapter slated for June 23-24, 2015 in Abuja, Nigeria	2332728	350.00	No Retirement
Nov 9-15	Julius Y. Saye keh -Nel	Payment as incidental expenditures for the 2015 National Conference of the MSME	2323230	2,500.00	Incidental incorrectly Applied
Nov 7-15	Andrew Pargar	Payment as foreign daily subsistence allowance for Deputy Minister Andrew Paygar travel to the United States from January 4-8,2015	2323250	250.00	No Retirement
Nov 12, 2012	United Motor Company	Payment of US\$43,120 made to United Motor Company for vehicle purchase, US\$3,350 unsupported	478822	3,350.00	No Document to support Variance
		TOTAL		27,199.00	

APPENDIX -2 PETTY CASH

Date	Vendor/Payee	Description	Check No.	MoCI/MSME Amount (US\$)	GOL Approved (US\$)	Variance (US\$)
March 13-12	Vivtoria K. Nyanquoi	Payment for the opening of petty cash fund	000430980	300.00	200.00	100.00
May 3-12	Victoria K. Nyanquoi	Payment to replenish petty cash	000461551	209.50	200.00	9.50
May 3-12	Victoria K. Nyanquoi	Payment to replenish petty cash	000461551	209.50	200.00	9.50
june 4-12	Victoria K. Nyanquoi	Payment to replenish petty cash	000461590	239.72	200.00	39.72
Aug. 6-12	Victoria K. Nyanquoi	Payment to replenish petty cash	000465360	204.02	200.00	4.02
Sept 13-12	Victoria K. Nyanquoi	Payment to replenish petty cash	000478778	243.65	200.00	43.65
Oct 11-12	Victoria K. Nyanquoi	Payment to replenish petty cash	000478801	219.11	200.00	19.11
Nov. 2012	Victoria K. Nyanquoi	Payment to replenish petty cash	000468907	224.47	200.00	24.47
Dec 11-12	Victoria K. Nyanquoi	Payment to replenish petty cash	000468923	238.98	200.00	38.98
Jan 25-13	Victoria K. Nyanquoi	Payment to replenish petty cash	000484653	250.40	200.00	50.40
Feb. 2013	Victoria K. Nyanquoi	Payment to replenish petty cash	000484670	231.00	200.00	31.00
April 9-13	Victoria K. Nyanquoi	Payment to replenish petty cash	000484601	262.50	200.00	62.50
May 2-13	Victoria K. Nyanquoi	Payment to replenish petty cash	000484623	287.94	200.00	87.94
June 12-13	Victoria K. Nyanquoi	Payment as replenishment to petty cash	000339205	293.50	200.00	93.50
Jul. 2013	Victoria K. Nyanquoi	Payment to replenish petty	000339252	290.33	200.00	90.33

*Auditor General's Report On the
Micro-Small Medium Enterprises Project
For the period February 2012 to December 2015*

Date	Vendor/Payee	Description	Check No.	MoCI/MSME Amount (US\$)	GOL Approved (US\$)	Variance (US\$)
		cash				
Sept 16-13	Victoria K. Nyanquoi	Payment to replenish petty cash	2206652	250.00	200.00	50.00
Nov. 2013	Victoria K. Nyanquoi	Payment to replenish petty cash	2206692	285.00	200.00	85.00
Jan. 2014	Victoria K. Nyanquoi	Payment to replenish petty cash	2206741	282.99	200.00	82.99
Feb 17-14	Victoria K. Nyanquoi	Payment to replenish petty cash	2206704	272.79	200.00	72.79
April 17-14	Victoria K. Nyanquoi	Payment to replenish petty cash	2240287	241.89	200.00	41.89
May 28-14	Victoria K. Nyanquoi	Payment to replenish petty cash	2240317	273.79	200.00	73.79
July 17-14	Victoria K. Nyanquoi	Payment to replenish petty cash	2245911	270.88	200.00	70.88
Aug. 2014	P. Momo Sesay	Payment to replenish petty cash	2302904	260.69	200.00	60.69
Sept 23-14	Victoria K. Nyanquoi	Payment to replenish petty cash	2236530	277.96	200.00	77.96
Nov 14-14	Victoria K. Nyanquoi	Payment to replenish petty cash	2236504	260.51	200.00	60.51
Feb. 2015	P. Momo Sesay, Jr.	Payment to replenish petty cash	2320815	260.51	200.00	60.51
May-15	P. Momo Sesay	Payment to replenish petty cash	2302904	260.69	200.00	60.69
Aug 10-15	P. Momo Sesay	Payment to replenish petty cash	2332554	260.00	200.00	60.00
Sept 18-15	P. Momo Sesay, Jr.	Payment to replenish petty cash	2332588	260.69	200.00	60.69
Dec 2-15	P. Momo Sesay, Jr.	Payment to replenish petty	2323245	260.69	200.00	60.69

Date	Vendor/Payee	Description	Check No.	MoCI/MSME Amount (US\$)	GOL Approved (US\$)	Variance (US\$)
		cash				
		TOTAL		7,683.70		1,683.70

APPENDIX 3a Payments Outside of the Project Scope: Allowances

Date	Vendor	Description	Check No.	Amount (US\$)
Nov 15-13	Jesse Dann	Payment represents housing and 1/3 of round trip (JFK-ROB) cost to the Policy Analyst, Office of the Minister of Commerce and Industry	2206699	3,200.00
July 22-14	Hon Axel M. Addy	Payment as foreign daily subsistence allowance Minister Addy to participate in the United Nations Conference on " New Partnership for the Development of Productive Capacities in LDC's in Cotonou, Republic of Benin	2245913	1,550.00
June 19-15	Julius Y. Saye - Keh nel	payment as incidental allowance for Mr. Julius Saye Keh - Nel to attend the Expert meeting on the Draft ECOWAS Small and Medium Enterprises (SMEs) strategy & ECOWAS SME Chapter slated for June 23-24, 2015 in Abuja, Nigeria	2332728	350.00
June 19-15	L' Aphie Travel Travel and tours	payment for air ticket for Mr. Julius Saye Keh - Nel to attend the Expert meeting on the Draft ECOWAS Small and Medium Enterprises (SMEs) strategy & ECOWAS SME Chapter slated for June 23-24, 2015 in Abuja, Nigeria	2332729	1,562.00
Dec 7-15	L' Aphie Travel and Tours	Payment represents cost of air -ticket for Deputy Minister Andrew Paygar to travel to the United States to attend SBA seminar from January 4-8,2015	2323249	3,140.16
Nov 11-15	Andrew Pargar	Payment as foreign daily subsistence allowance for Deputy Minister Andrew Paygar travel to the United States from January 4-8,2015	2323250	2,350.00
July 18-14	Hon. Cyril A. Allen, II	Payment as foreign daily subsistence allowance and incidental allowance for Deputy Minister Cyril A. Allen, II travel to Abuja to attend the Nigeria -Liberia Joint Commission meeting	2245912	1,500.00
July 29-14	Axel M. Addy	Payment as foreign daily subsistence allowance for Minister Axel M. Addy to attend the AGOA Forum, President Barack Obama US-Africa Leaders Summit and series of	2245914	6,238.00

Date	Vendor	Description	Check No.	Amount (US\$)
		meetings in Washington D.C. USA		
Nov 12-14	Axel M. Addy	Payment as foreign daily subsistence allowance to facilitate the travel of Hon. Axel M. Addy, Minister of MOCI to the Second Conference of IGNITE to be held in Amsterdam, Netherlands from November 16 - 22nd 2014 as well as Rome and Brussels.	2236502	3,783.32
Sept 17-13	Samuel W. Jacobs	Payment as incidental allowance for Samuel W. Jacobs to Nairobi, Kenya	2206653	350.00
Nov 25-13	Joseph Tamba	Payment as incidental allowance to attend a training course in development of SMEs in South Korea	2206294	550.00
Nov 25-13	Richard Pratt	Payment as incidental allowance to attend a training course in development of SMEs in South Korea	2206295	550.00
Nov 25-13	Orlance Bracewell	Payment as incidental allowance to attend a training course in development of SMEs in South Korea	2206293	550.00
Nov 25-13	Refus Kakar	Payment as incidental allowance to attend a training course in development of SMEs in South Korea	2206292	550.00
Nov 25-13	Edna Bropleh	Payment as incidental allowance to attend a training course in development of SMEs in South Korea	2206291	550.00
Nov 25-13	Victoria K. Nyanquoi	Payment as incidental allowance to attend a training course in development of SMEs in South Korea	2206290	550.00
Nov 25-13	Emmanuel Kapee	Payment as incidental allowance to attend a training course in development of SMEs in South Korea	2206289	550.00
Nov 25-13	Samuel W. Jacobs	Payment as incidental allowance to attend a training course in development of SMEs in South Korea	2206288	550.00
Apr 2-14	P.Momo Sesay, Jr.	Payment of Incidental allowance for travel to Japan	2240281	1,075.00
May 8-14	Christopher Kennedy	Payment as incidental allowance for Christopher Kennedy	2240296	975.00
Jan 15-14	Frederick C. Yagbah	Payment for renovation works at the MSME division due to the President visit at MOCI	2206742	2,000.00
	TOTAL			32,473.48

Appendix 3b Payments Outside of the Project Scope: Vendors

Date	Vendor/Payee	Description	Check No.	Amount (US\$)
April 15-14	General Construction & Cement Products	Payment represents cost for renovation, transportation,	2240280	3,361.91

*Auditor General's Report On the
Micro-Small Medium Enterprises Project
For the period February 2012 to December 2015*

Date	Vendor/Payee	Description	Check No.	Amount (US\$)
		workmanship & contingency for the Trade Store		
Nov 12-14	Modern Refrigeration Corp.	Payment for the purchase of one 240000 BTU Split unit at the "Made in Liberia Trade Store.	2240301	1,000.00
Aug 7-14	General Construction & cement Products	Payment represents cost to change some of the zinc at the " Made in Liberia Trade Store"	2245896	303.75
Sept 5-14	Baker Tilly Auditing Firm	Payment represents audit fees to the Baker Tilly Auditing Firm for auditing the financial statements of the EIF/NIU for the period January to December 2012	2245917	3,509.00
Sept 5-14	Fabrar Liberia, Inc.	Payment for the purchase of 100 (one hundred) bags of rice by the Ministry of Commerce and Industry	2236527	3,500.00
May 26-15	Ministry of Commerce and Industry	payment to MoCI Operation account by MSME as its contribution to MoCI Operational account	2236515	1,491.00
Sept 9-15	P & R Contractors	Payment as part - payment against US\$2,580.63 for the renovation of the Ministry of Commerce and Industry Central Office	2302907	500.00
Dec 7-15	Auto Run General Spare Parts	Payment for the servicing of the Deputy Minister for Small Business Administration vehicle RL-577	2332572	897.60
Dec 7-15	Up Town Garage	Payment for the repairs of Deputy Minister Andrew G. Paygar personal vehicle (PC - 33489)	2323248	728.99
Oct 7-13	Terravilla Gardens , Inc.	Payment as first installment payment against US\$8,000 for MOCI New Home landscaping	2206668	3,000.00
April 16-14	Jola House	Payment as 1 st installment towards the cost to produce 300 pcs of Conference Bags for the Second National MSME Conference & Trade Fair 2014	2240284	3,000.00
Feb 4-15	Land Commission	Payment as domestic daily subsistence allowance for eight representatives of Inter- Agency Technical Committee, the purchase of fifty gallons of fuel, publicity, and contingency	2320817	1,891.15
	TOTAL			23,183.40

APPENDIX 4 SAFEGUARDING OF ASSETS
ASSETS NOT VERIFIED

No.	Description	Code	Serial No.	Assignee
1	Toyota Fortuna Suv- Black 2012 Model with Chassis No:MHFYX59G1C8033269	GSA-01-36-RL	MHFYX59G1C8033269	Pewee Reed
2	Laptop (Dell)	N/A	N/A	Julius Y. Saye-Kernel
3	IBX Projector	N/A	N/A	Minister's Office
Assets Not Coded				
1	Desk	N/A		Momo Sasey
2	Chair	N/A		Momo Sasey
3	Chair	N/A		Momo Sasey
4	Chair	N/A		Momo Sasey
5	Air conditional	N/A	N/A	Momo Sasey
6	Libetelco phone	N/A	N/A	Momo Sasey
7	Air conditional	N/A	N/A	Ass. Minister
8	DESK	N/A		Staff Office
9	Chair (Plastic)	N/A		Staff Office
10	Chair (Plastic)	N/A		Staff Office
11	Desk	N/A		Staff Office
12	Air conditional	N/A	N/A	Deputy Minister
Damaged Assets				
1	Chair	Moci-420-40	N/A	Conference Room
2	Chair	Moci-420-27	N/A	Conference Room
3	Chair	Moci-420-39	N/A	Conference Room
4	Chair	Moci-420-25	N/A	Conference Room
5	Chair	C-011	N/A	Conference Room
6	Chair	C-011	N/A	Conference Room
7	Chair	C-011	N/A	Conference Room
8	Chair	Moci-420-36	N/A	Conference Room
9	Chair	Moci-420-35	N/A	Conference Room
10	Chair	Moci-420-37	N/A	Conference Room
11	Chair	Moci-420-32	N/A	Conference Room
12	Chair	Moci-420-30	N/A	Conference Room
13	Chair	Moci-420-54	N/A	Conference Room
14	Chair	Moci-420-51	N/A	Conference Room
15	Chair	Moci-420-38	N/A	Conference Room
16	Chair	Moci-420-43	N/A	Conference Room
17	Chair	Moci-420-24	N/A	Conference Room
18	Chair	Moci-420-29	N/A	Conference Room
19	Chair	Moci-420-26	N/A	Conference Room

*Auditor General's Report On the
Micro-Small Medium Enterprises Project
For the period February 2012 to December 2015*

No.	Description	Code	Serial No.	Assignee
20	Chair	Moci-420-28	N/A	Conference Room
21	Chair	Moci-420-42	N/A	Conference Room
22	Chair	Moci-420-41	N/A	Conference Room
23	Type Writer	N/A	N/A	Ass. Minister
24	Cpu	N/A	N/A	Staff office
25	Printer(hp)	N/A	N/A	Staff office
26	Chair	Moci-GSA	N/A	Staff office
27	Cpu(hp)	Moci	N/A	Staff office
28	Cpu(hp)	N/A	N/A	Staff office
29	Cpu(hp)	N/A	N/A	Staff office
30	Chair	GSA	N/A	Staff office
31	Printer(hp)	N/A	2R1421R44	Staff office
32	Chair	N/A	N/A	Staff office
33	Chair	N/A	N/A	Staff office
34	Monitor(HP)	N/A	N/A	Staff office
35	Monitor(HP)	N/A	N/A	Staff office
36	Monitor(HP)	N/A	N/A	Staff office
37	Printer(hp)	N/A	N/A	Staff office
	Assets not Found on Listing			
1	Large perforator	N/A	N/A	Resource Center
2	Back up Battery	N/A	N/A	Resource Center
3	Bulleting Board	N/A	N/A	Resource Center
4	Organizers	N/A	N/A	Resource Center
	Assets found on listing but not seen			
1	Desk	Moci-420-07	N/A	Resource Center
2	Desk	Moci-420-04	N/A	Resource Center
3	DESK	Moci-420-05	N/A	Resource Center
4	DESK	Moci-420-06	N/A	Resource Center
5	Chair	Moci-420-03	N/A	Resource Center
6	Chair	Moci-420-18	N/A	Resource Center
7	Chair	Moci-420-17	N/A	Resource Center
8	Chair	Moci-420-14	N/A	Resource Center
9	Chair	Moci-420-15	N/A	Resource Center
10	Chair	Moci-420-16	N/A	Resource Center
11	Chair	Moci-420-13	N/A	Resource Center
12	Chair	Moci-420-12	N/A	Resource Center
13	Chair	GSA	N/A	Resource Center
14	Chair	GSA	N/A	Resource Center
15	Chair	Moci-420-11	N/A	Staff Office

*Auditor General's Report On the
Micro-Small Medium Enterprises Project
For the period February 2012 to December 2015*

No.	Description	Code	Serial No.	Assignee
16	Chair	Moci-420-27	N/A	Staff Office
17	Chair	Moci-420-45	N/A	Staff Office
18	Chair	Moci-420-011	N/A	Staff Office