



Promoting Accountability of Public Resources

AUDITOR GENERAL'S REPORT



On The Audit of the Liberia Institute of Public Administration (LIPA)

*For the Period July 1, 2015 to
June 30, 2016*

July, 2017

**Yusador S. Gaye, CPA, CGMA
Auditor General, R.L.**

Table of Content

BACKGROUND	7
Audit Objectives	7
Audit Methodology	8
Limitation of Responsibility	8
1 DETAILED FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	9
1.1 Financial Issues	9
1.1.1 Undisclosed Bank Accounts and Reconciliations	9
1.1.2 Payments without Adequate Supporting Documentation	11
1.1.3 Retirement of Travel Expense.....	12
1.1.4 Payments to Third Party	14
1.1.5 Preparation of Financial Statements.....	15
1.1.6 Revenue Irregularities	16
1.2 Compliance Issues.....	18
1.2.1 Payroll Irregularities	18
1.2.2 Fixed Assets Management.....	19
1.2.3 Policies and Procedures	20
1.2.4 Internal Audit Unit.....	21
1.2.5 Lack of Designated Account	22
1.2.6 No Policy for Honorarium	23
1.2.7 No Risk Management Policy	24
1.2.8 Draft Human Resources Policy.....	25
1.2.9 Training Irregularities	26
2 ACKNOWLEDGEMENT	28
APPENDICES	29

Acronyms/Abbreviations/Symbols

Acronyms/Abbreviations/Symbol	Meaning
A/C#	Account Number
AG	Auditor General
BEP	Bid Evaluation Penal
CBL	Central Bank of Liberia
CGMA	Certified Global Management Accountant
COSO	Committee of Sponsoring Organizations
CPA	Certified Public Accountant
DG	Director General
FY	Fiscal Year
GAC	General Auditing Commission
GOL	Government of Liberia
GSA	General Services Agency
ISSAIs	International Standards of Supreme Audit Institutions
L\$	Liberian Dollars
LBDI	Liberia Bank for Development & Investment
LIPA	Liberia Institute of Public Administration
PFM Act	Public Finance Management Act
PPC Act	Public Procurement Concessions Act
US\$	United States Dollar

July 19, 2017

Hon. Oblayon B. Nyemah

Director General

Liberia Institute of Public Administration
Republic of Liberia

Dear Hon. Nyemah:

Compliance Report on the Liberia Institute of Public Administration for the Period July 1, 2015 to June 30, 2016

We have audited the activities and financial transactions of the Liberia Institute of Public Administration in compliance with relevant laws and regulations for the periods ended June 30, 2013 **consistent with the Auditor General's mandate as provided for in Section 2.1.3 of the General Auditing Commission (GAC) Act of 2014** as well as the Audit Engagement Terms of Reference (ToR).

Management's Responsibility

Management is responsible for the preparation of financial records in accordance with the terms of local agreement and stated laws and regulations.

This audit was conducted on the basis or understanding that the Management of the Liberia Institute of Public Administration has the responsibility to establish and maintain internal controls necessary to:

- Enable it undertake its contracts award, goods delivery, projects execution, evaluation and reporting in an effective and efficient manner as well as the preparation of documentation on the procurement/projects that are free from material misstatements whether due to fraud or error and in compliance with authorities that govern them;
- Provide reasonable assurance that adopted policies and prescribed procedures are adhered to and errors and irregularities, including fraud and illegal acts are prevented or detected; and to provide us with access to the following:
- All information of which the Liberia Institute of Public Administration is aware of and that is relevant to its contracts award, goods delivery, projects execution, evaluation and reporting as well as their related documentation;
- Any additional information that we may request from Administration for the purposes of the review; and
- Unrestricted access to persons within the Institution Administration from whom we determine it necessary to obtain review evidence.

Auditor's Responsibility

Our responsibility is to independently express a conclusion on the financial records of the Liberia Institute of Public Administration based on our audit. Our audit was conducted in accordance with the International Standards of Supreme Audit Institutions (ISSAIs), Fundamental Auditing Principles (FAP) and Guidelines for Compliance Audit (GCA). Those principles require that we comply with ethical requirements and plan and perform the audit so as to obtain reasonable assurance as to whether the use of Liberia Institute of Public Administration funds are in compliance, in all material respects, with stated laws and regulations.

An audit involves performing procedures to obtain sufficient appropriate evidence to support our conclusion. The procedures performed depend on the auditor's professional judgment, including assessing the risk of material non-compliance, whether due to fraud or error. The audit procedures performed are those we believe are appropriate in the circumstances. We believe that the audit evidence gathered is sufficient and appropriate to provide the basis for our conclusion.

Basis for Disclaimer Conclusion

The LIPA Management did not disclose its International Bank Account in its financial statements. The entity carried out several transactions in the account. For example, LIPA Management per its cashbook made a transfer from the International Bank (Liberia) Limited (IB) Account in the amount of US\$23,000.00 to the First International Bank USD Account No. 001201493001 on October 14, 2014.

The Liberia Institute of Public Administration made payment for various items in the amount of **US\$16,677.00** (Sixteen Thousand Six Hundred Seventy-Seven United States Dollars) were without adequate support documentation.

The LIPA Management made payments to several employees amounting to **US\$9,555.00** (Nine Thousand Five Hundred Fifty-Five United States Dollars) for daily subsistence and incidental allowances for foreign and domestic travels without evidence that these allowances were retired and/or accounted for.

The LIPA Management made multiple payments amounting to **US\$14,445.00** (Fourteen Thousand Four Hundred Forty-Five United States Dollars) to several individuals and/or employees of the entity rather than the service providers.

The LIPA Management made payments in the name of four former employees amounting to **L\$209,600.00** (Two Hundred Nine Thousand Six Hundred Liberian Dollars) whose services were terminated and were still maintained on the payroll.

The LIPA Management made payments for honorarium to employees and internal facilitators amounting to **US\$13,379.00** (Thirteen Thousand Three Hundred Seventy-Nine United States Dollars) without evidence of a formal policy.

The LIPA Management did not maintain fixed assets registry that would show a list of coded assets, date of purchase, cost, location, assignee and current condition. Due to the absence of fixed assets listing that meets the requirement of the PFM Act, we were unable to obtain reasonable assurance as to the accuracy and completeness of the assets owned by LIPA.

Disclaimer Conclusion

Based on the audit work performed, because of the significance of the matter noted in the Basis for Disclaimer paragraph's above, we are unable to, and therefore do not express a conclusion on the Liberia Institute of Public Administration's compliance in all material respects, with stated laws and regulations.



**Yusador S. Gaye, CPA, CGMA
Auditor General. R.L.**

**Monrovia, Liberia
July, 2017**

BACKGROUND

Background of the Liberia Institute of Public Administration Audit

The audit of the Liberia Institute of Public Administration was commissioned by the Auditor General for period July 1, 2015 to June 30, 2016.

A Brief History of LIPA

The Liberia Institute of Public Administration (LIPA) was established by an Act of the Legislature of Liberia in 1969 which came into operation in 1972 as the Capacity Building Institute of Government. The Institute shall be primarily concerned with improving the administrative performance and professional capabilities of the Government public service through training of personnel, research in problems of public administration and consultation in public administration with the purpose of developing, for maximum utilization, the potential sources of talent of the manpower of the country.

LIPA is headed by a Director General/Superintendent and assisted by three (3) officers/deputies. It is sub-divided into five operational divisions, each with distinct functional tasks which include:

- Human Resource Management Division;
- Budget & Finance Division;
- IT System Management Division;
- Procurement & Logistics Division; and
- General Services & Maintenance Division.

The Liberia Institute of Public Administration has the following personnel who handled the administrative and financial affairs of the institution for the period under audit.

Key Personnel of LIPA

No.	Name	Position	Tenure
1	Harold J. Monger	Director General	2003-2013
2	Oblayon Blayon Nyemah, Sr.	Director General	2013-Present
3	P. EmMersyn Harris	Deputy Director General, Admin.	2003-2015
4	Richard S. Pantan	Deputy Director General, Training	1998-2015
5	Harris F. Tarnue	Deputy Director General, Research & Consultancy	2003-2015
6	Florence Geegbae-Dukuly	Deputy Director General, Admin.	2015-Present
7	Jarso Jallah-Saygbe	Deputy Director General, Training	2015-Present
8	Charles G. R. Jarrett, Sr.	Deputy Director General, Research & Consultancy	2015-Present
9	Luna Harmon	Comptroller	2014-Present
10	Patrice P. Weah	Legal Council	2013-Present

Audit Objectives

The main objective of the audit is to gather sufficient appropriate audit evidence to conclude whether the activities and financial information of the Liberia Institute of Public Administration for the period July 1, 2015 to June 30, 2016 are in compliance, in all material respects with policies, procedures, applicable laws, regulations, and are free of material errors.

Audit Methodology

The audit was conducted in accordance with the International Standards of Supreme Audit Institutions (ISSAIs). Those standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain reasonable assurance that the financial information provided by the Management of the Liberia Institute of Public Administration is in compliance, in all material respects with policies, procedures, applicable laws, regulations, and are free of material errors. In furtherance of this, we undertook audit procedures as would enable us to attain the above objective.

Our **audit also took cognizance of the requirements under the Auditor General's mandate** as provided for under Section 2.1.3 of the GAC Act of 2014 well as the Audit Engagement Terms of Reference (TOR). Our audit approach included observation, inquiries, inspections, re-performance, confirmation, and analytical procedures on areas we considered as high risk.

While the audit was not directed at reporting the following, we have reported on the below issues which came to our attention during the course of the audit:

- Non- effective performance of the program - relates to **Management's responsibility** to undertake activities in a non-effective and non-efficient manner.
- Non-delivery of goods and services – **relates to Management's non-exercise** of responsibility to ensure that all goods and services procured are delivered.
- Instances of non-compliance with applicable laws and regulations - relates to **Management's non-exercise** of responsibility to use resources, and fulfill accountability requirements, in accordance with applicable agreements, laws and regulations governing contracts award, goods and service delivery, projects execution, evaluation and reporting.
- Waste – **relates to Management's non-exercise** of responsibility to obtain and apply resources in an economical manner, without any public money being wasted.
- Instances of abuse- **relates to Management's non-** exercise of responsibility to meet the expectations of the National Legislature and the public as they relate to appropriate standards of behavior.

Limitation of Responsibility

We reviewed the systems and management controls operated by the Liberia Institute of Public Administration only to the extent we considered necessary for the effective conduct of this audit. As a result, our review may not have detected all weaknesses that existed or all improvements that could be made.

1 DETAILED FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

1.1 Financial Issues

1.1.1 Undisclosed Bank Accounts and Reconciliations

Observation

- 1.1.1.1 Regulation I. 19 of the PFM Act of 2009 states that "The Responsibility of the Auditor-General for examining and certifying government accounts does not relieve any officer responsible for keeping and rendering such accounts from the duty to comply and to ensure that subordinates comply with provisions of any enactment, these regulations and with any instructions or directions issued under them."
- 1.1.1.2 Additionally, Regulation R3.6 of the PFM Act of 2009 states that "The balance of every bank account as shown in a bank statement shall be reconciled with the corresponding cashbook balance at least once every month; and the reconciliation statement shall be filed or recorded in the cash book or the reference to the date and number thereof."
- 1.1.1.3 It was observed during the conduct of the audit that the Management of LIPA did not disclose its International Bank Account in its financial statements. The entity carried out several transactions in the account. For example, LIPA Management per its cashbook made a transfer from the International Bank (Liberia) Limited (IB) Account in the amount of US\$23,000.00 to the First International Bank USD Account No. 001201493001 on October 14, 2014.
- 1.1.1.4 Further, there were many inaccuracies observed on the bank reconciliation statements prepared by the LIPA Management. **See table 1 below for detail:**

Table 1: Bank Reconciliations

Date	Balance per cash book as per reconciliation statement (A) USD	Balance per cash book as per Ledger (B) USD	Variance (C=A-B) USD
Dec. 31, 2015	28,378.12	28,813.12	(435.00)

Risk

- 1.1.1.5 The accuracy and completeness of the financial statements could be in doubt in the absence of the non-disclosure of some of the entity's bank accounts.
- 1.1.1.6 Also, disagreements between the cash book balance per the reconciliation statements and the cashbook balance per the ledger could cast doubt on the accuracy of the bank reconciliation statement prepared by the LIPA Management.

Recommendation

- 1.1.1.7 The LIPA Management should provide substantive justification for not disclosing the various bank accounts in its financial.
- 1.1.1.8 Additionally, the LIPA Management should provide substantive justification for the variance between the cashbook balance per the reconciliation statement and the cashbook balance per the reconciliation statements.
- 1.1.1.9 Going forward, the LIPA Management should disclose all financial information including bank account details.

Management's Response

- 1.1.1.10 *On August 4, 2016, the GAC requested several documents from LIPA to facilitate the conduct of the audit. (Please see exhibit- 001) The request was made for the bank reconciliation statements (this will include active bank accounts, cash book and the reconciled statement). The account at Ecobank was not an active account and was closed since April 30, 2013. **(Please see exhibit- 002)** LIPA management also wish to inform the GAC that the account number reported in the Audit Report is not the correct account number. A bank statement from that account to show the correct account number **(Please see exhibit-003)**.*
- 1.1.1.11 ***In view of the above, LIPA's management supplied all active bank account statement.** Management wish to inform the GAC that it did not intentionally fail to disclose the inactive bank account. Management will also like to inform GAC that it can write the Ecobank to provide all bank statement if this is required for further review. Bank reconciliation was a challenge for the institution. Upon my taking over, several reforms were fast tracked to address several financial, administrative and financial issues the institute faced with. These reforms were conducted through the USAID/GEM as they provide both training and technical capacity to the Budget and Finance Staff. We have made significant achievement in this regards.*
- 1.1.1.12 ***The management notes its' inadvertent lapse on the disclosure of the Account Title:** Liberia Institution of Public Administration and Account #: 02201003655601. The account was and is dedicated to a Special Project with support from IPFMRP to train staff at the Legislative Budget Office and Internal Audit Agency (IAA). Because of the form and manner in which this project was structured, the Institute had to use a dedicated account. Lump sum payments out of the account were payments made against different groups of participants in the form of Transportation; Stationary; Facilitation Fees; etc...**Management takes due and judicial notes of this inadvertent oversight and would do all it can to advert such a situation in the future. This account remains open and has a balance of US\$817.25. (See exhibit...)***

Auditor General's Position

- 1.1.1.13 The request by GAC for the presentation of bank reconciliation statements did not state reconciliation for only active accounts. It is standard financial management requirement to prepare reconciliation for both active and inactive bank accounts as their combined

closing balances at the close of the fiscal period should constitute the actual cash balance of the entity. The undisclosed Ecobank Account was obtained by the GAC through confirmation letters issued to various banks requesting banking information of LIPA. There were no bank reconciliation statements prepared for this account and its closing balance was not included in the cash balance at the close of the fiscal period 2013/2014.

- 1.1.1.14 **Additionally, LIPA Management's Assertion that the undisclosed account reported in the GAC report is "not correct" cannot be materially supported. This account mentioned in the audit report was obtained directly from the bank through our confirmation procedure.**
- 1.1.1.15 Also, LIPA Management failed to address the inaccuracies between its bank reconciliation statements and its cash book. Therefore, the LIPA Management is in breach of Regulation A. 20 of the PFM Act of 2009.
- 1.1.1.16 Further, LIPA Management assertion that its failure to disclosure its International Bank (Liberia) Limited **Account titled "Liberian Institute of Public Administration" instead of the Liberia Institute of Public Administration** was an inadvertent lapse cannot be supported. A sample analysis of transactions from the account shows that a total amount of US\$80,725 was paid to Mr. Beford Quie, a staff at LIPA. Also, most transactions on this IB Bank Accounts were **not** recorded in the cashbook of LIPA. Therefore, considering the nature of these transactions, we will refer this matter to the Liberia Anti-Corruption Commission (**LACC**) for further investigation.

1.1.2 Payments without Adequate Supporting Documentation

Observation

- 1.1.2.1 Regulation P.9 (2) of the PFM Act of 2009 states: **"Payments except for statutory transfers and debt service shall be supported by invoices, bills and other documents in addition to the payment vouchers"**.
- 1.1.2.2 It was observed during the conduct of the audit that payment made for various items in the amount of **US\$16,677.00** (Sixteen Thousand Six Hundred Seventy-Seven United States Dollars) were without adequate support documentation. **Refer to Appendix 1 for details.**

Risk

- 1.1.2.3 The receipt of goods cannot be assured in the absence of supporting documents such as delivery/goods received notes.

Recommendation

- 1.1.2.4 The LIPA Management should provide the necessary supporting documents for the purchase of the items listed on **Appendix 1.**

- 1.1.2.5 Going forward, the LIPA Management should ensure that all supporting documentations are attached payment vouchers.

Management's Response

- 1.1.2.6 *The adequate filing of documents in the budget and office has been a challenge. Management is currently reviewing all files to ensure that he payment vouchers with the necessary supporting documents are filed properly. As part of the reform process all financial documentation will be routed through the Internal Audit Division to ensure full compliance with the financial management laws of Liberia on increase accountability.*

Auditor General's Position

- 1.1.2.7 We acknowledge Management acceptance of our recommendations. However, Management is in breach of Regulation A.20 of the PFM Act of 2009.

1.1.3 Retirement of Travel Expense

Observation

- 1.1.3.1 **Count 24 of the GOL's Travel Ordinance on Foreign Travel states that "Upon return from abroad, officials are required to submit to the Ministry of Finance, a Travel Settlement Form as per Annexure II within 21 days from the date of return from tour or before date of next journey, whichever is earlier. In very exceptional cases where the second tour is performed immediately after return from the first tour; the second advance may be granted with the specific written approval of the Minister concerned, explaining the reasons thereof."**
- 1.1.3.2 **Also, Count 25 of the GOL's Travel Ordinance on Foreign Travel also states that "No future travel advances shall be paid to anyone who has failed to submit the prescribed Travel Disbursement Form, for any previous journey within 21 days. The entire travel advance will be recovered from those who fail to submit the Travel Settlement Form on return from their visit abroad, and those who subsequently leave the service of the Government, from any arrears due to them by the Government.**
- 1.1.3.3 **Further, Count 15 and 16 of the GOL's Travel Ordinance on Domestic Travel stats that "Upon completion of a travel officials are required to submit to the Ministry of Finance THE TRAVEL SETTLEMENT FORM per Annexure II within 21 days of their return. No future domestic travel advance shall be paid to anyone who has filed to submit the prescribed Domestic Travel Settlement Form within 21 days after return from the previous journey."**
- 1.1.3.4 **Additionally, Section 54 of the amended and restated PPC Act States that "Quotations shall be requested in writing from as many bidders as practicable, but from at least three (3) bidders" that is required for purchases with threshold of less than US\$10,000.**
- 1.1.3.5 It was observed during the conduct of the audit that the LIPA Management made payments to several employees amounting to **US\$9,555.00** (Nine Thousand Five Hundred Fifty-Five United States Dollars) for daily subsistence and incidental allowances

for foreign and domestic travels without evidence that these allowances were retired and/or accounted for.

- 1.1.3.6 Also, it was observed that the LIPA Management did not obtain at least three quotations required to purchase air tickets travels in compliance with the PPCC Act of 2010, **See table 2 for details.**

Table 2: Retirement of Travel Expense

No.	Date	Payee	Description	Check No.	Amount USD	Comment
1.	Aug. 12, 2015	Universal Travel Services, Inc.	Payment for foreign Travel air-tickets	00142584	1,689.00	Voucher not supported by tax clearance, cash invoice with expired business reg. certificate.
2.	Aug. 27, 2015	Universal Travel Services, Inc.	Payment for foreign means of Travel	00142578	3,216.00	Voucher is supported with expired business registration Certificate
3.	Jan. 12, 2016	Travel Int'l Travel Services	Payment for air-ticket for DG & Academic Registrar	2293614	1,354.00	Voucher not supported by three (3) quotations and business registration.
4.	Jan. 12, 2016	Florence Geegbae Dukuly	Payment for foreign travel (DSA & Incidental allowance)	2293615	1,714.00	Voucher not supported by three (3) quotations, tax clearance, business reg., etc.
5.	Feb. 15, 2016	Oblayon B. Nyemah	Payment for foreign travel for DG	2293577	1,582.00	Vouchers not supported by three (3) quotations, tax clearance and business registration.
Total					US\$9,555.00	

Risk

- 1.1.3.7 Failure to retire allowances undermines the accountability of public resources.
- 1.1.3.8 Payments without adequate supporting documentation could cast doubt on the regularity of the transactions and undermine public sector accountability and transparency.

Recommendation

- 1.1.3.9 The LIPA Management should provide material justification for failing to retire foreign and domestic per diem allowances.
- 1.1.3.10 Management should also provide material justification for failing to obtain three quotations from travel agents for air tickets purchased.

- 1.1.3.11 Going forward, the LIPA Management should ensure that foreign and domestic per diem allowances are retired and/or accounted for.
- 1.1.3.12 Also, the LIPA Management should ensure that three quotations are obtained from travel agents for air tickets purchased.

Management's Response

- 1.1.3.13 *Management acknowledge the fact that it is difficult to get employees to file up the travel settlement form upon their return. LIPA Management acknowledge the General Auditing Commission assertions on "Retirement of Travel Expense" and assures the Auditor General that going forward we will ensure full compliance with the Local and Foreign Travel Ordinance of Government of Liberia.*

Auditor General's Position

- 1.1.3.14 The LIPA Management is required to ensure that all staff members who undertook travels retired timely their travel advances. In the absence of retirement of travel advances, the entire amount should be recovered from those who failed to submit their travel settlement forms. For those who have left LIPA, the entity should also recover the amount from them in line with the travel ordinance.

1.1.4 Payments to Third Party

Observation

- 1.1.4.1 Regulation B. 28 of the PFM Act of 2009 states that "A payment shall be made only to the person or persons named on the payment voucher or to their representatives duly and legally authorized in writing to receive the payment."
- 1.1.4.2 It was observed during the conduct of the audit that the LIPA Management made multiple payments amounting to **US\$14,445.00** (Fourteen Thousand Four Hundred Forty-Five United States Dollars) to several individuals and/or employees of the entity rather than the service providers. **Refer to Appendix 3 for details:**

Risk

- 1.1.4.3 Checks issued in the names of individuals and/or employees could be diverted to personal use thus leading to misappropriation of funds.

Recommendation

- 1.1.4.4 The LIPA Management should provide substantive justification for authorizing payments in the names of individuals who did not directly provide goods and services.
- 1.1.4.5 Going forward, the LIPA Management should refrain from making payments to individuals and/or employees who did not directly provide goods and services to the entity.

Management's Response

- 1.1.4.6 *LIPA is a training institute that provides services to both the private and public sectors. Most of the training for public or private institutions are conducted in the counties which*

require DSA or attendees fees which covers hotel accommodation and or feeding. Because the participants at most time not from LIPA but various institutions, it is possible to prepare checks for all of them until the start of the training. The actual attendees are provided DSA/per diem. The cashier/Finance officer accompanies the training team is and disburse funds to participants and provide the payment and other relevant documentation to justify the disbursement. These payment are done by finance staff due to the number of participants. PFM Regulation B28 "A payment shall be made only to a person or persons named on the payment voucher or their representatives duly and legally authorized in writing to receive payments". All payments were made to payee stated on the voucher for various activities and programs to implement even though some payee didn't match the description. However, LIPA's management acknowledge the party payment issues and going forward we will ensure it is in compliance.

Auditor General's Position

- 1.1.4.7 Management's assertion is not materially supported and cannot be sustained on the merit. Management should have written DSA checks and payments for goods and services in the names of the participants and service providers. Management provided no evidence that it was legally authorized to make these payments to LIPA employees. Further, we did not see any evidence that these payments were received by the intended beneficiaries. Therefore, the Management of LIPA is in breach of Regulation A.20 of the PFM Act of 2009, as such all LIPA staff members who received these payments as shown in Appendix 2 should be held accountable for the amounts.

1.1.5 Preparation of Financial Statements

Observation

- 1.1.5.1 Paragraph 1.3.4 of International Public Sector Accounting Standard (IPSAS) Cash Basis of accounting requires that entity should prepare and present general purpose financial statements which include the following components:
- a) A statement of cash receipts and payments which:
 - b) Recognizes all cash receipts, cash payments and cash balances controlled by the entity; and
 - c) Separately identifies payments made by third parties on behalf of the entity in accordance with paragraph 1.3.24 of this Standard;
 - d) Accounting policies and explanatory notes; and
 - e) When the entity makes publicly available its approved budget, a comparison of budget and actual amounts either as a separate additional financial statements or as a budget column in the statement of cash receipts and payments in accordance with paragraph 1.9.8 of this Standard.
- 1.1.5.2 It was observed during the conduct of the audit that the LIPA Management did prepare and present financial statements for audit purpose. The financial statements were not in compliance with the requirements of International Public Sector Accounting Standards (IPSAS) Cash Basis, adopted by the Government of Liberia.

Risk

- 1.1.5.3 **The failure to prepare financial statements based on GOL's** adopted financial reporting framework could undermine Government efforts to strengthen financial accountability and control over public receipts and expenditure.

Recommendation

- 1.1.5.4 The LIPA Management should provide substantive justification for not preparing financial statement in accordance with IPSAS Cash Basis.
- 1.1.5.5 Going forward, the LIPA Management should prepare and present financial statement in accordance with IPSAS Cash Basis.

Management's Response

- 1.1.5.6 *IPSAS Financial Statement were prepared the Budget and Finance office in Line with IPSAS Standard. All funds from the enterprise funds are capture as cash receipts (Other Revenue on financial statements under cash receipts and statements). All transfer from MFDP (eg. Operational Funds, Workshops, Conference, etc) are not capture as revenue. It is however capture in the Cash Book as the funds passes through the bank accounts of the institute. All cash receipts will not be capture as revenue. Appropriation from GOL through the Ministry of Finance and Development Planning is capture under "Payment by Other Government Entities" on the IPSAS Financial Statement. This is based on the guidelines set by MFDP for preparation of Financial Statement.*

Auditor General's Position

- 1.1.5.7 The financial statements presented by Management did not meet the requirement of IPSAS cash basis of accounting. Management presented **"financial statements" for the** fiscal year 2015/2016 without evidence that it has been approved. There is no date of approval **and the approving authority's signature.** Therefore, Management should ensure that the financial statements are approved before issuance.

1.1.6 Revenue Irregularities

Observation

- 1.1.6.1 Regulations A. 3 (1 and 2) of the PFM Act 2009 states that **"Any public officer concerned** with the conduct of financial matters of the Government of Liberia, or the receipt, custody and disbursement of public and trust moneys, or for the custody, care and use of government stores and inventories shall keep books of accounts and proper records of all transactions and shall produce the books of accounts and records of the transactions for inspection when called upon to do so by the Auditor General, the Comptroller General, the relevant internal auditor or any officers authorized by them, by the Minister. A public officer who fails to keep or produce any records under this regulation is in a **breach of financial discipline as defined in Regulation A.20."**
- 1.1.6.2 Section 36 (1 and 2) of the PFM Act of 2009 states that **"It is a general responsibility** under this Act for all government officials handling public financial transactions to ensure that financial information is reported in a timely, comprehensive, and accurate manner, in the manner, where applicable, to provide a monthly report on revenues and a

quarterly expenditures performance report to the Minister in the terms, format and within the timeframe determined by regulations under this Act.”

- 1.1.6.3 It was observed during the conduct of the audit that the total amount reported on the LIPA Financial Statement (Enterprise Funds) could not tie to the amount reported on the cash book for the period under audit. **See table 3 below for details:**
- 1.1.6.4 Further, it was observed that the LIPA Management did not maintain general ledger to properly record the revenue generated within the entity.

Table 3: Financial Statements Amt. (Enterprise Funds) vs. Cash Book Analysis

Financial Statements (Enterprise Funds) USD	Total Cash Book Amount (USD)	Variance USD
444,113.00	537,986.51	(93,871.51)

Risk

- 1.1.6.5 Failure to monitor controls governing the collection of revenues provides opportunities for abuse of the revenues.

Recommendation

- 1.1.6.6 The LIPA Management should provide material justification why the revenue recorded in the cashbook could not tie in with the financial statement.
- 1.1.6.7 Going forward, the LIPA Management should initiate appropriate internal controls such as the maintenance of general ledger and cashbook to properly record revenues generated on the financial statement.

Management's Response

- 1.1.6.8 *All funds from the enterprise funds are capture as cash receipts (Other Revenue on financial statements under cash receipts and statements). All transfer from MFDP (eg. Operational Funds, Workshops, Conference, etc) are not capture as revenue. It is however capture in the Cash Book as the funds passes through the bank accounts of the institute. All cash receipts will not be capture as revenue. Appropriation from GOL through the Ministry of Finance and Development Planning is capture under "Payment by Other Government Entities" on the IPSAS Financial Statement. This is based on the guidelines set by MFDP for preparation of Financial Statement.*

Auditor General's Position

- 1.1.6.9 **Management's assertion is not materially** supported. All internally generated revenue received by LIPA should be recorded in the cashbook and reported in the financial statements. The failure to properly report the internally generated revenue understates the receipts reported in the financial statements rendering the financial statements unreliable. Therefore, we maintain our recommendations.

1.2 Compliance Issues

1.2.1 Payroll Irregularities

Observation

1.2.1.1 Regulation T.5 (1) of PFM Act, 2009 states that, "A Head of government agency shall cause the immediate stoppage of payment of salary to a public servant when that public servant has: (a) been absent from duty without permission or reasonable cause for a period as stipulated in the administrative regulations of the establishment; (b) been absent from duty on leave without pay; (c) been convicted of an offence involving theft or fraud, or a sentence of imprisonment; (d) resigned; (e) retired; or (f) died".

1.2.1.2 It was observed during the conduct of the audit that the names of four (4) employees were still being maintained on LIPA Payroll after their services were terminated.

1.2.1.3 It was also observed that the total payment made in the name of the four employees amounted to Two Hundred Nine Thousand Six Hundred Liberian Dollars **(L\$209,600.00)**. See table 4 for details:

Table 4: Payroll Irregularities

Name	Position	Payroll #	Date of Death/Resignation	Trace to Payroll After Statutory Period (death Only)	Gross Salary (LRD)	No. of Months Spent on Payroll	Total Gross Salary (LRD)
Richard S. Panton	Deputy Director General/Training	13-01-001-0002	Terminated	Dec. 2015-Feb. 2016	17,600.00	3	52,800.00
Harris F. Tarnue, Sr.	Deputy Director General/Research & Consul.	13-02-002-0064	Terminated	Dec. 2015-Feb. 2016	17,600.00	3	52,800.00
P. Emmers yn Harris	Deputy Director General/Adm.	13-03-003-0028	Terminated	Dec. 2015-Feb. 2016	17,600.00	3	52,800.00
Ruth T. Duncan	Secretary/DDG/R &C	13-01-001-0007	Dismissal	Mar.-Jun. 2016	12,800.00	4	51,200.00
Total							L\$209,600.00

1.2.1.4 There was no evidence that the employees were removed from the LIPA's Payroll.

Risk

1.2.1.5 Paying salary to employee who had not worked could result to unjust salary to ghost employee.

Recommendation

- 1.2.1.6 The Management of LIPA should provide material justification for paying salary to employees who had left the entity.
- 1.2.1.7 Going forward, the LIPA Management should ensure that employees who had left the entity are removed from its payroll.

Management's Response

- 1.2.1.8 *The Appointment/Dismissal of the Director-General of LIPA is at the will and pleasure of the President of the Republic of Liberia. The three Deputies Director Generals for Training, Research and Administration were terminated by the president and the Civil Service Agency is responsible for the removal and replacement of those appointed officials. Ruth T. Duncan was dismissed and removed from the allowance. **(Please see exhibit 015 dismissal letter)**. On Ruth T. Duncan issue the signing-in and out on the attendance log has been an issue that management has taken very step to mitigate this problem. There has been salaries deductions letters of suspension and/ or warning letters to employee or time. However, for effective monitoring of employees attendance management has introduced the biometric sign-in and out system. Please see exhibit on **biometric equipment at LIPA's entrance use to monitor staff attendance**.*
- 1.2.1.9 *LIPA's management has the authority to immediately remove any employee who is dismissed or abandon the in violation of the HR Policy and Civil Service Standing from the Special or General Allowance. However, the process to remove or replace a Civil Servant from the payroll is within the purview of the Civil Service Agency Personnel Action Notice. During the period under review, the Civil Service Agency put a halt to all payroll activities.*

Auditor General's Position

- 1.2.1.10 We acknowledge Management's assertion that it introduced the biometric sign-in and out system and has taken steps to mitigate the problem. However, during the 2015/2016 fiscal year, the attendance log was not monitored by Management. Management did not provide any evidence that it communicated with the CSA to remove deceased or separated employee from the payroll. Therefore, Management is accountable for the payment of salaries to employees that are no longer with LIPA.

1.2.2 Fixed Assets Management

Observation

- 1.2.2.1 Regulation V.1 (2a&b) of the PFM Act of 2009 states that, "The Head of Government Agency must take full responsibility of assets assigned to him by the General Services Agency and ensure that proper control systems exist for assets and that: (a) preventive mechanisms are in place to eliminate theft, losses, wastage and misuse; and (b) inventory levels are at **an optimum and economical level**".
- 1.2.2.2 It was observed during the conduct of the audit that the LIPA Management did not maintain fixed assets registry that would show a list of coded assets, date of purchase, cost, location, assignee and current condition.

Risk

- 1.2.2.3 **In the absence of fixed assets listing, the ownership and existence of the entity's assets cannot be assured and can be susceptible to theft.**

Recommendation

- 1.2.2.4 The LIPA Management should provide material justification for not providing fixed assets listings for all assets acquired for the period under audit.
- 1.2.2.5 Going forward, the LIPA Management should provide fixed assets listing for all assets acquired and disposed for the period under audit.
- 1.2.2.6 Additionally, proper fixed assets internal controls policies and procedures aligned with PFM regulations should be adopted and implemented for the maintenance of fixed assets.

Management's Response

- 1.2.2.7 *LIPA maintain a fixed Asset Registry which has been updated. However the fixed asset registry is not comprehensive with lack of information on cost date of purchase and location. These issues were also brought up in an internal managerial system review (Risk Assessment) and Finance & Procurement divisions are currently updating the needed information. LIPA has been working closely with the GSA on fully updating the master registry. Going forward all asset processed by or donated to LIPA will be recorded with all information on the fixed asset registry.*

Auditor General's Position

- 1.2.2.8 **We accept Management's acknowledgement of our findings and its assertion that the GSA is updating LIPA fixed assets registry. However, the LIPA Management is in breach of Regulation A. 20 of the PFM Act of 2009.**

1.2.3 Policies and Procedures

Observation

- 1.2.3.1 The Committee of Supporting Organization of the Treadway Commission (COSO) internal control framework on control activities stipulates that **"Institutions deploy control activities through policies that establish what is expected and procedures that put policies into action"**. **Policies and procedures are established and implemented to help ensure that risk responses are effectively carried out within an entity.**
- 1.2.3.2 It was observed during the conduct of the audit that the LIPA Management did not develop and/or communicate policies, guidance or procedures on the following activities:
- Accounting Manual
 - Accounts Reconciliation
 - Petty Cash
 - Scholarship procedures and processing
 - Internal Controls

Risk

- 1.2.3.3 The lack of policies and procedures to regulate activities may lead to discretionary decisions and abuse of public funds.

Recommendation

- 1.2.3.4 The LIPA Management should provide material justification for failing to institute policies and procedures to guide the activities.
- 1.2.3.5 Going forward, the LIPA Management should ensure that policies and procedures are put in place to guide the activities.

Management's Response

- 1.2.3.6 *Hon Oblayon B. Nyemah took over the mantle of authority at the Institute on April 1, 2013 almost at the end of the budget year. He continued and fast tracked the reform process at the Institute initiative by the previous administration and USAID-GEM. Staff were trained and policies were developed and adopted senior management. **(Please see exhibit 016, 005 & 008 Policy Manual, Petty Cash Policy and Training & Development Policy)** I am pleased to inform you that LIPA has an approved (Policy Manual) which covers policy, administrative, financial and operational issues. A petty cash policy has been reviewed and approved. Management will ensure that all procedure in those policy are fully adhere to.*

Auditor General's Position

- 1.2.3.7 We acknowledge the "Policy Manual, Petty Cash Policy and Training & Development Policy" developed by Management. Management should also develop other relevant policy documents for the smooth operation of LIPA.

1.2.4 Internal Audit Unit

Observation

- 1.2.4.1 Section 38 (1a and d) of the PFM Act of 2009 requires internal audit unit "to periodically review the organization of financial management within the organization so as to identify weaknesses and recommend to the line minister or head of agency remedial actions where required or desirable and inform the Minister accordingly".
- 1.2.4.2 It was observed during the conduct of the audit that there was no evidence of internal audit function to monitor and/or evaluate the system and controls at LIPA.

Risk

- 1.2.4.3 The lack of periodic review of the financial management activities of an organization by an internal audit unit may lead to internal control weaknesses not being identified on a timely basis for corrective actions to be taken.

Recommendation

- 1.2.4.4 The LIPA management should provide material justification for failing to establish internal audit function at LIPA.

- 1.2.4.5 Going forward, the LIPA Management should establish an internal audit to monitor and/or evaluate the flow of business transactions at LIPA.

Management's Response

- 1.2.4.6 *As part of management's ongoing reform system the setting up of the Internal Audit Unit in the Institute was paramount. The Internal Audit Agency established by law to administer internal audit functions in branches of government was written by management to help establish the internal audit function (Unit) in LIPA. The Internal Audit Unit is now establish and commenced the review of our system and making recommendation for improvement. It is our hope with the current reform, LIPA will have an improve financial management system during your nest review. I have attached several communications between the Internal Audit Agency and Liberia Institute of Public Administration to verify my assertion of a functional unit. **(Please see exhibit 006-1 to 006-6)***

Auditor General's Position

- 1.2.4.7 We acknowledge Management's assertion that it has engaged the Internal Audit Agency to review LIPA's internal control systems and make recommendations. During the 2015/2016 fiscal year, LIPA did not have a functional internal audit unit in place. Therefore, Management is in breach of Regulation A.20 of the PFM Act of 2009.

1.2.5 Lack of Designated Account

Observation

- 1.2.5.1 Regulation B.8 (1&2) of the amended and restated PFM Act, States that "(1) All public moneys collected and retained by a government agency, shall be paid in gross into the designated bank accounts and no use shall be made by any public officer of monies collected in any manner between the time of its receipts and payment into the bank except as provided by an enactment. (2) A Government agency that has legislative approval to retain all or a portion of Internally Generated Funds collected, must first lodge the retained
- 1.2.5.2 Internally Generated Funds in gross into the **Government agency's operational bank account before using the Government agency's disbursement process to spend it."**
- 1.2.5.3 It was observed during the audit that LIPA appears not to have a designated account to collect and deposit training fees. Further, it appears fees are generally deposited in all accounts maintained by the entity such as LBDI, FIB (now GN) and the Central Banks.

Risk

- 1.2.5.4 Failure to collect and retain internally generated funds into a designated account could lead to misappropriation and abuse of public resources.

Recommendation

- 1.2.5.5 The LIPA Management should provide material justification for failing to collect and retain internally generated funds into a designated operational account.

- 1.2.5.6 Going forward, the LIPA Management should ensure that all funds collected shall be paid in gross into a designated account and disbursed in line with the entity's disbursement process.

Management's Response

- 1.2.5.7 *LIPA has a designated account for students to deposit training fees. The designated account is the FIB (now GN Bank). The account title is: Liberia Institute of Public Administration with account number (0011201493001). Students are to complete application form and obtain a provisional admission letter with student fees stated. Letter is taken to the Budget & Finance Office and obtain a deposit slip. **(Please see attached exhibit-007-1 & 007-2)** The deposit slip indicated the name of the bank, account title and name of depositor. That is the only account designated for students fees.*

Auditor General's Position

- 1.2.5.8 **Management's assertion is not materially supported.** Documents provided by Management confirmed that LIPA tuition and fees were generally deposited at LBDI, FIB (now GN) and the Central Banks. Management should establish a designated account for the deposit of all tuition and fees. Therefore, is in breach of Regulation A.20 of the PFM Act of 2009.

1.2.6 No Policy for Honorarium

Observation

- 1.2.6.1 The Committee of Supporting Organization of the Treadway Commission (COSO) internal control framework on control activities stipulates that, "Institutions deploy control activities through policies that establish what is expected and procedures that put policies into action". Policies and procedures are established and implemented to help ensure that risk responses are effectively carried out within an entity.
- 1.2.6.2 It was observed during the conduct of the audit that the LIPA Management made payments for honorarium to employees and internal facilitators amounting to **US\$13,379.00** (Thirteen Thousand Three Hundred Seventy-Nine United States Dollars) without evidence of a formal policy. **See table 5 below for details:**

Table 5: Payment for Honorarium

No.	Date	Description	Payee	Check No.	Amount USD
1	July 8, 2015	Amount represents payment of honorarium	P. EmMersyn Harris	00049813	2,000.00
2	July 12, 2015	Amount represents payment of honorarium	P. EmMersyn Harris	2329336	3,750.00
3	Sept 9, 2015	Amount represents payment of entertainment for the Training of Trainers workshop	David Kirlee Swen	2329304	792.00
4	Sept 9, 2015	Amount represents payment of transportation allowance for the	David Kirlee Swen	2329304	

No.	Date	Description	Payee	Check No.	Amount USD
		trainers			162.00
5	Sept 9, 2015	Amount represents payment of honorarium for the trainers	David Kirlee Swen	2329304	125.00
6	Sept 9, 2015	Amount represents payment of Administrative support for the TOT workshop	David Kirlee Swen	2329304	150.00
7	Sept 24, 2015	Amount represents payment of honorarium for the training support services	Jessy K. Fayou	2329308	150.00
8	Nov 10, 2015	Amount represents payment of honorarium	Bill McGill Jones	00049924	250.00
9	June 16, 2016	Amount represents payment of honorarium for the UNMIL Project	Dempster G. Togba	0049943	6,000.00
Total					US\$13,379.00

Risk

- 1.2.6.3 The lack of policies and procedures may lead to discretionary decisions and abuse of public funds.

Recommendation

- 1.2.6.4 The LIPA Management should provide material justification for failing to institute policies and procedures to guide the payment of honorarium.
- 1.2.6.5 Going forward, the LIPA Management should ensure that policies and procedures are put in place to guide the payment of honorarium.

Management's Response

- 1.2.6.6 *LIPA has developed several policies to help safe guard public funds and at the same time ensure consistency and accountability. LIPA has developed and adopted the "policy and procedures for the Training & Manpower Development". This document among other things addresses the standard for paying facilitator and the payment of honorarium. (Please see exhibit 008, Section 8.0 "Payment As Honorarium").*

Auditor General's Position

- 1.2.6.7 Management presented a "policy and procedures for the Training & Manpower Development" without evidence that it has been approved and adopted. There is no date of approval and the approving authority's signature. Therefore, the Management should approve and adopt the policy to make it effective.

1.2.7 No Risk Management Policy

Observation

- 1.2.7.1 Regulation A.15 (1) PFM Act of 2009, stipulates that "the head of government agency must exercise all reasonable care to prevent and detect unauthorized, irregular, fruitless and wasteful expenditure, and must for this purpose implement clearly defined business

processes, identify risk associated with these processes and institute effective internal control to mitigate these risks”.

1.2.7.2 Additionally, the Internal Control Integrated Framework, published by the Committee of Sponsoring Organizations of the Tread way Commission (COSO), requires the State Own Enterprise to establish a risk Assessment policy which will set the basis for conducting risk assessment within the Corporation and also determining the risk that may impact **negatively the achievement of the entity's objectives, such** as, technological, economic, administrative, security and how each risk should be managed. Risks assessment allows an entity to consider the extent to which potential events have an impact on the achievement of objectives.

1.2.7.3 It was observed during the conduct of the audit that the LIPA Management did not have risk management policy to mitigate and/or manage risk in the entity.

1.2.7.4 Further, there was no evidence of risk management policy and risk assessment report on the entity's operations covering the periods under audit so as to determine the risk issues faced by the entity in achieving its objectives.

Risk

1.2.7.5 Failure to maintain risk management policy could lead to proper procedures and appropriate controls not being instituted in the entity.

Recommendation

1.2.7.6 LIPA Management should establish risk management policy and perform risk assessment procedures, in order to identify and mitigate and/or manage risk that could negatively impact the entity's ability to achieve its objectives.

Management's Response

1.2.7.7 *The Internal Audit Agency as part of its functions conducts Risk Assessment of the institution and provide recommendation for mitigation. Please find attach Risk Assessment Report by IAA for 2016-2017. **(Please see exhibit 013 Risk Assessment conducted by Internal Audit Agency)***

Auditor General's Position

1.2.7.8 Risk assessment report is not risk assessment policy. The Management of LIPA did not have in place a risk assessment policy during the audit period. Therefore, the LIPA management should develop and approve a risk assessment policy.

1.2.8 Draft Human Resources Policy

Observation

1.2.8.1 The Committee of Supporting Organization of the Treadway Commission (COSO) internal control framework on control activities stipulates that, **“Institutions deploy control activities through policies that establish what is expected and procedures that put policies into action”**. Policies and procedures are established and implemented to help ensure that risk responses are effectively carried out within an entity.

1.2.8.2 Additionally, Standard internal control practice requires Management to develop policies relating to Human Resources (HR). Having a system of clear, concise, written policies is vital in HR planning, administrative personnel functions, and performance management and employee relations within organizations. Such policies should include matters pertaining to the following: orientation, promotions, and compensation, training and continuous development of employees. There should also be skills retention and monitoring, health retirement/benefits, personnel insurance as well as vacation etc. In addition to the above, there must be evidence that the policies and procedures have been properly communicated to all employees across the organization.

1.2.8.3 It was observed during the period under audit that the Management of LIPA provided the audit team a draft Human Resource Policy & Procedure Manual.

1.2.8.4 Further, the issues of orientation, training, promotion, compensation, recruitment, health retirement/benefits and vacation for employees were not fully addressed by the LIPA Human Resource Policy Manual.

Risk

1.2.8.5 Failure to have an approved Human Resource policy could expose the entity to violation of employment laws.

1.2.8.6 Lack of Human Resource policy could lead to inconsistent and unfair treatment of employees.

Recommendation

1.2.8.7 The Management of LIPA should provide justification for not having an approved Human Resource Policy and Procedure Manual.

Management's Response

1.2.8.8 *The Human Resource Policy has been approved by LIPA's Management. (Please see exhibit-014) In addition to the Human Resource Policy, LIPA's Policy and Procedure Manual focuses on other HR Procedures and Policy which include but not limited to: Employment, employment decision, Types of employment, employment orientation. Re – employment of form employee, attendee etc. (Please see exhibit 011)*

Auditor General's Position

1.2.8.9 We acknowledge Management's assertion that it has dated and approved its policy and procedure manual. However, Management presented a "policy and procedures manual for Human Resources" for the fiscal year 2015/2016 without evidence that it has been approved and adopted. There is no date of approval and the approving authority's signature. Therefore, we maintain our recommendations.

1.2.9 Training Irregularities

Observation

1.2.9.1 The Committee of Supporting Organization of the Treadway Commission (COSO) internal control framework on control activities stipulates that "Institutions deploy control

activities through policies that establish what is expected and procedures that put **policies into action**". **Policies and procedures are** established and implemented to help ensure that risk responses are effectively carried out within an entity.

1.2.9.2 It was observed during the conduct of the audit that training documents reviewed covering cycle 12th show that the records of students from the Training department and that of Finance department appear not to be consistent.

1.2.9.3 Further, it was observed that of names of some students were omitted from the Finance department database but maintained on the Training department listing. **See Appendix 3 for details:**

Risk

1.2.9.4 Inconsistency between the Finance department records and that of Training department could mislead users of proper information.

1.2.9.5 Omission of names from the Finance department database could lead to fraud.

Recommendation

1.2.9.6 The Management of LIPA should provide material justification for omitting and failing to **reconcile students'** records between the Finance and Training Departments.

1.2.9.7 The LIPA Management should reconcile all of its records between the Finance and Training Department.

Management's Response

1.2.9.8 *The Training and Development Department has structure training programs. (Please see attached exhibit 008 cover the entire policies and procedure around LIPA's training process).*

Auditor General's Position

1.2.9.9 Management presented a "**policy and procedures for the Training & Manpower Development**" without evidence that it has been approved and adopted. There is no date of approval and the approving authority's signature. **The Management should approve and adopt the policy to make it effective.** Therefore, we maintain our recommendations.

2 ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

- 2.1 We acknowledge the cooperation and assistance provided to the GAC Audit Team by the Management and staff of the Liberia Institute of Public Administration during the audit. The efforts and commitment of GAC staff in conducting this audit are also gratefully acknowledged.



Yusador S. Gaye, CPA, CGMA
Auditor General. R.L.

Monrovia, Liberia
July, 2017

APPENDICES

Appendix 1: Payments without Adequate Supporting Documentation

No.	Date	Payee	Description	Voucher No.	Check No.	Amount USD	Comment
1	17-Sep-15	J- Mart, Inc.	Payment for the furniture.	536	142563	1,600.00	No evidence of three quotations, no delivery note, no tax Clearance and business registration
2	2-Oct-15	J- Mart, Inc.	Payment to settle chairs bought on acct.	553	142560	991.00	No evidence of three quotations, no delivery note, no tax Clearance and business registration
3	19-Jan-15	J- Mart, Inc.		648	2293618	1,463.00	No evidence of three quotations, no delivery note, no tax Clearance and business registration
4.	9-Jun-16	Graceland Int'l, Inc.	Payment for the printing of the graduation souvenir	829	78946	2,000.00	No evidence of delivery note, no tax Clearance and business registration
5.	9-Jun-16	George C. Nyanti	Payment for additional stationary	831	2293597	766.00	No evidence of three quotations, no delivery note, no tax Clearance and business registration
6.	14-Aug-15	Wynston E. Poure	Payment for ICT equipment	498	2329343	1,100.00	No evidence of three quotations, no delivery note, no tax Clearance and business registration
7.	17-Sep-15	J- Mart, Inc.	Payment for furniture	535	49834	2,000.00	No evidence of delivery note, no tax Clearance and business registration
8.	15-Sep-15	Aminata & Son	Payment for fuel & lubricants	533	142569	600.00	No evidence of bid documents, no delivery note, no tax Clearance and business registration
9.	15-Jun-16	Kamal Business Center	Payment for assorted materials	833	178948	385.00	No evidence of three quotations, no delivery note and business registration
10.	18-Feb-16	Cavalla Logistic & Investment	Payment for repairs & maintenance	692	2293581	3,557.00	No evidence of three quotations, no delivery note and business



No.	Date	Payee	Description	Voucher No.	Check No.	Amount USD	Comment
		Corp.					registration
11.	5-Apr-16	Robert N. George	Payment for consultancy services	729	49937	500.00	No evidence of contract for the consultant service
12.	6-Apr-16	Genuine Auto Service	Payment for repair & maintenance of vehicle	734	178915	310.00	No evidence of delivery note
13.	6-Apr-16	Genuine Auto Service	Payment for repair & maintenance for vehicle	752	178924	230.00	No evidence of delivery note, no tax Clearance and business registration
14.	19-Apr-16	Genuine Auto Service	Payment for spare parts	573	N/A	175.00	No evidence of delivery note
15.	4-Dec-15	David K. Swen	Payment for Local travel	617	49926	1,000.00	Vouchers not supported by three (3) quotations, tax clearance and business registration.
Total						US\$16,677.00	

Appendix 2: Payments made to Third Party

No.	Date	Description	Payee	Check No.	Amount (USD)
1	Jul 14, 2015	Amount represents payment of fuel for the Public Sector Modernization Project Team	Mariam Kamara	00049909	400.00
2	Jul. 14, 2015	Amount represents payment of stipend and fuel for the Public Sector Modernization Project Team	Mariam Kamara	00049909	375.00
3	Aug. 14, 2015	Amount represents payment facilitation of diagnostic research/design	George C. Nyanti	49913	4,600.00
4	Oct. 2, 2015	Amount represents payment of employee assistance in favor of the Director-General	G. Wesley Colley	00049843	800.00
5	Oct. 20, 2015	Amount represents payment of local scholarship in favor of the	Laurel S. Fallah		

*Auditor General's Report On The Liberia Institute of Public Administration (LIPA)
For the Period July 1, 2015 to June 30, 2016*

No.	Date	Description	Payee	Check No.	Amount (USD)
		Director-General		00049850	1,030.00
6	Oct. 20, 2015	Amount represents payment of board sitting fees	Laurel S. Fallah	00049851	1,500.00
7	Nov. 25, 15	Amount represents payment ICT repair	Wynston E. Poure	00049927	200.00
8	Dec. 3, 2015	Amount represents payment of quarterly assembly of the Liberia Bar Association in favor of LIPA legal counselor (Patrice Weah)	Patrice Weah	00049861	275.00
9	Mar. 24, 2016	Amount represents payment for the repair & Maintenance of ICT equipment	Wynston E. Poure	00178982	1,400.00
10	Mar. 24, 2016	Amount represents payment for the repair & Maintenance of ICT equipment	Wynston E. Poure	00178982	1,400.00
11	Mar. 11, 2016	Amount represents payment of driver's license in favor of LIPA's drivers	Nathaniel Wesseh	00178905	210.00
12	Apr. 15, 2016	Amount represents payment of repairs & maintenance ICT equipment	Wynston E. Poure	00178919	200.00
13	Apr. 26, 2016	Amount represents payment of hall rental for the LIPA's graduation	George C. Nyanti	2293592	400.00
14	May 26, 2016	Amount represents payment of stationery for LIPA's 11th cycle graduation	George C. Nyanti	2293596	634.00
15	Jun. 7, 2016	Amount represents payment for the notarization of the external facilitators contracts	Patrice Weah	00178945	255.00
16	Jun. 9, 2016	Amount represents payment of additional stationery cost for the 11th cycle graduation	George C. Nyanti	2293597	766.00
Total					US\$14,445.00



Appendix 3: Training Irregularities

#	Description	Information from class listing of Training Dept.			Information from Database of Finance Dept.		Variances	
		No.	COURSES	Number of students	Course fees	Total receipt (USD)	Number of students on database	Amount on database (USD)
1	Internal Audit & Control	30	310	6,955.00	30	6,955.00		
2	Monitoring & Evaluation-Certificate	78	310	16,090.00	78	16,090.00		
3	Monitoring & Evaluation-Diploma	5	500	810.00	5	810.00		
4	Procurement-Diploma	19	510	6,140.00	19	6,140.00		
5	Procurement-Certificate	72	310	14,985.00	72	14,985.00		
6	Project Planning & Management Certificate	36	310	7,120.00	36	7,120.00		
7	Banking & Finance/ Certificate	6	310	1,240.00	6	1,240.00		
8	Record Management	13	100	815.00	13	815.00		
9	HR Performance Management	25	310	5,325.00	24	5,025.00	1	300
10	Human Resource Management Diploma	7	500	1,010.00	7	1,010.00		
11	Basic Report writing	14	100	600.00	14	600.00		
12	Public Financial Management Law	6	100	400.00	6	400.00		
13	Public Financial Management	15	310	3,410.00	15	3,410.00		

*Auditor General's Report On The Liberia Institute of Public Administration (LIPA)
For the Period July 1, 2015 to June 30, 2016*

#	Description	Information from class listing of Training Dept.			Information from Database of Finance Dept.		Variances	
No.	COURSES	Number of students	Course fees	Total receipt (USD)	Number of students on database	Amount on database (USD)	Per Student	Per Amount
14	Public Policy Analysis	10	310	1,865.00	10	1,865.00		
15	Work Planning & Reporting	4	100	100.00	4	100.00		
16	Public Sector Management	2	310	310.00	2	310.00		
17	Purchasing Supply	10	100	790.00	10	790.00		
18	Customer Service	3	100	200.00	3	200.00		
19	Basic Computer & Database	5	100	500.00	5	500.00		
		360		US\$68,665.00	359	US\$68,365.00	1	300