



Promoting Accountability of Public Resources

## AUDITOR GENERAL'S REPORT



**On The Audit of the Liberia Institute  
of Public Administration (LIPA)**

*For the Period July 1, 2012 to June  
30, 2013*

**July, 2017**

**Yusador S. Gaye, CPA, CGMA  
Auditor General, RL**

## **Table of Content**

<b>BACKGROUND .....</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>Audit Objectives .....</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>Audit Methodology .....</b>	<b>8</b>
<b>Limitation of Responsibility .....</b>	<b>8</b>
<b>1 DETAILED FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS .....</b>	<b>9</b>
<b>1.1 Financial Issues .....</b>	<b>9</b>
1.1.1 Undisclosed Bank Account and Reconciliation.....	9
1.1.2 Payments without Adequate Supporting Documentation .....	11
1.1.3 Retirement of Travel Expense.....	12
1.1.4 Payments to Third Party.....	14
1.1.5 Preparation of Financial Statements .....	15
1.1.6 Checks written out of Numerical Sequence .....	16
1.1.7 Petty Cash.....	17
<b>1.2 Compliance Issues.....</b>	<b>18</b>
1.2.1 Payroll Irregularities .....	18
1.2.2 Fixed Assets Management.....	20
1.2.3 Policies and Procedures .....	21
1.2.4 Internal Audit Unit.....	22
1.2.5 Lack of Designated Account .....	23
1.2.6 No Policy for Honorarium .....	24
1.2.7 Consulting Facilitators.....	24
1.2.8 Fuel and Lubricant.....	26
1.2.9 Retirement of Employee.....	27
<b>2 ACKNOWLEDGEMENT .....</b>	<b>28</b>
<b>APPENDICES .....</b>	<b>29</b>



### **Acronyms/Abbreviations/Symbols**

<b>Acronyms/Abbreviations/Symbol</b>	<b>Meaning</b>
A/C#	Account Number
AG	Auditor General
BEP	Bid Evaluation Penal
CBL	Central Bank of Liberia
CGMA	Certified Global Management Accountant
COSO	Committee of Sponsoring Organizations
CPA	Certified Public Accountant
CSA	Civil Service Agency
DG	Director General
FY	Fiscal Year
GAC	General Auditing Commission
GOL	Government of Liberia
GSA	General Services Agency
ISSAIs	International Standards of Supreme Audit Institutions
L\$	Liberian Dollars
LBDI	Liberia Bank for Development & Investment
LIPA	Liberia Institute of Public Administration
PFM Act	Public Finance Management Act
PPC Act	Public Procurement Concessions Act
US\$	United States Dollar



## **AUDITOR GENERAL'S REPORT**

July 19, 2017

Hon. Oblayon B. Nyemah

### **Director General**

Liberia Institute of Public Administration

Republic of Liberia

Dear Hon. Nyemah:

### **Compliance Report on the Liberia Institute of Public Administration for the Period July 1, 2012 to June 30, 2013**

We have audited the activities and financial transactions of the Liberia Institute of Public Administration in compliance with relevant laws and regulations for the periods ended June 30, 2013 **consistent with the Auditor General's mandate as provided for in Section 2.1.3 of the General Auditing Commission (GAC) Act of 2014 as well as the Audit Engagement Terms of Reference (ToR).**

### **Management's Responsibility**

Management is responsible for the preparation of financial records in accordance with the terms of local agreement and stated laws and regulations.

This audit was conducted on the basis or understanding that the Management of the Liberia Institute of Public Administration has the responsibility to establish and maintain internal controls necessary to:

- Enable it undertake its contracts award, goods delivery, projects execution, evaluation and reporting in an effective and efficient manner as well as the preparation of documentation on the procurement/projects that are free from material misstatements whether due to fraud or error and in compliance with authorities that govern them;
- Provide reasonable assurance that adopted policies and prescribed procedures are adhered to and errors and irregularities, including fraud and illegal acts are prevented or detected; and to provide us with access to the following:
- All information of which the Liberia Institute of Public Administration is aware of and that is relevant to its contracts award, goods delivery, projects execution, evaluation and reporting as well as their related documentation;
- Any additional information that we may request from Administration for the purposes of the review; and
- Unrestricted access to persons within the Institution Administration from whom we determine it necessary to obtain review evidence.



### **Auditor's Responsibility**

Our responsibility is to independently express a conclusion on the financial records of the Liberia Institute of Public Administration based on our audit. Our audit was conducted in accordance with the International Standards of Supreme Audit Institutions (ISSAIs), Fundamental Auditing Principles (FAP) and Guidelines for Compliance Audit (GCA). Those principles require that we comply with ethical requirements and plan and perform the audit so as to obtain reasonable assurance as to whether the use of Liberia Institute of Public Administration funds are in compliance, in all material respects, with stated laws and regulations.

An audit involves performing procedures to obtain sufficient appropriate evidence to support our conclusion. The procedures performed depend on the auditor's professional judgment, including assessing the risk of material non-compliance, whether due to fraud or error. The audit procedures performed are those we believe are appropriate in the circumstances. We believe that the audit evidence gathered is sufficient and appropriate to provide the basis for our conclusion.

### **Basis for Disclaimer Conclusion**

The Management of LIPA failed to disclose in its summary of cash balance its Ecobank Account titled Liberia Institute of Public Administration (LIPA). Further, there were many inaccuracies observed on the bank reconciliation statements prepared by the LIPA Management. Due to the numerous inaccuracies noted in the Bank Reconciliation statements, we could not confirm that cash and bank balances that should have been recorded were actually recorded and disclosed.

The Liberia Institute of Public Administration made payments for various items in the amount of **US\$11,315.00** (Eleven Thousand, Three Hundred Fifteen United States Dollars) and **L\$371,913.00** (Three Hundred Seventy-One Thousand Nine Hundred Thirteen Liberian Dollars) without adequate support documentation.

The LIPA Management made payments to several employees amounting to **US\$14,358.00** (Fourteen Thousand, Three Hundred Fifty-Eight United States Dollars) for daily subsistence and incidental allowances for foreign and domestic travels without evidence that these allowances were retired and/or accounted for.

The Liberia Institute of Public Administration made multiple payments amounting to **US\$54,238.00** (Fifty Four Thousand Two Hundred Thirty-Eight United States Dollars) to several individuals and/or employees of the entity rather than the service providers.

LIPA Management made payment for honorarium to employees and internal facilitators amounting to **US\$8,490.00** (Eight Thousand Four Hundred Ninety United States Dollars) and **L\$46,300.00** (Forty-Six Thousand Three Hundred United States Dollars) without evidence of a formal policy.


The LIPA Management made multiple payments for the procurement of fuel and lubricant in the amount of **US\$48,054.62** (Forty-Eight Thousand Fifty-Four United States Dollars & Sixty-Two Cents) without evidence of an Open Competitive Bidding Process.



The LIPA Management did not maintain fixed assets registry that would show a list of coded assets, date of purchase, cost, location, assignee and current condition. Due to the absence of fixed assets listing that meets the requirement of the PFM Act, we were unable to obtain reasonable assurance as to the accuracy and completeness of the assets owned by LIPA.

**Disclaimer Conclusion**

Based on the audit work performed, because of the significance of the matter noted in the Basis for Disclaimer paragraph's above, we are unable to, and therefore do not express a conclusion on the Liberia Institute of Public Administration's compliance in all material respects, with stated laws and regulations.

  
**Yusador S. Gaye, CPA, CGMA**  
**Auditor General. R.L.**

**Monrovia, Liberia**  
**July, 2017**



## **BACKGROUND**

### **Background of the Liberia Institute of Public Administration Audit**

The audit of the Liberia Institute of Public Administration was commissioned by the Auditor General for period July 1, 2012 to June 30, 2013.

### **A Brief History of LIPA**

The Liberia Institute of Public Administration (LIPA) was established by an Act of the Legislature of Liberia in 1969 which came into operation in 1972 as the Capacity Building Institute of Government. The Institute shall be primarily concerned with improving the administrative performance and professional capabilities of the Government public service through training of personnel, research in problems of public administration and consultation in public administration with the purpose of developing, for maximum utilization, the potential sources of talent of the manpower of the country.

LIPA is headed by a Director General/Superintendent and assisted by three (3) officers/deputies. It is sub-divided into five operational divisions, each with distinct functional tasks which include:

- Human Resource Management Division;
- Budget & Finance Division;
- IT System Management Division;
- Procurement & Logistics Division; and
- General Services & Maintenance Division.

The Liberia Institute of Public Administration has the following personnel who handled the administrative and financial affairs of the institution for the period under audit.

### **Key Personnel of LIPA**

<b>No.</b>	<b>Name</b>	<b>Position</b>	<b>Tenure</b>
1	Harold J. Monger	Director General	2003-2013
2	Oblayon Blayon Nyemah, Sr.	Director General	2013-Present
3	P. EmMersyn Harris	Deputy Director General, Admin.	2003-2015
4	Richard S. Panton	Deputy Director General, Training	1998-2015
5	Harris F. Tarnue	Deputy Director General, Research & Consultancy	2003-2015
6	Florence Geegbae-Dukuly	Deputy Director General, Admin.	2015-Present
7	Jarso Jallah-Saygbe	Deputy Director General, Training	2015-Present
8	Charles G. R. Jarrett, Sr.	Deputy Director General, Research & Consultancy	2015-Present
9	Jacob K. Monjue	Comptroller	2009-2013
10	Luna Harmon	Acting Comptroller	2013-2014
11	Patrice P. Weah	Legal Council	2013-Present

### **Audit Objectives**

The main objective of the audit is to gather sufficient appropriate audit evidence to conclude whether the activities and financial information of the Liberia Institute of Public Administration for the period July 1, 2012 to June 30, 2013 are in compliance, in all material respects with policies, procedures, applicable laws, regulations, and are free of material errors.



## **Audit Methodology**

The audit was conducted in accordance with the International Standards of Supreme Audit Institutions (ISSAIs). Those standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain reasonable assurance that the financial information provided by the Management of the Liberia Institute of Public Administration is in compliance, in all material respects with policies, procedures, applicable laws, regulations, and are free of material errors. In furtherance of this, we undertook audit procedures as would enable us to attain the above objective.

**Our audit also took cognizance of the requirements under the Auditor General's** mandate as provided for under Section 2.1.3 of the GAC Act of 2014 well as the Audit Engagement Terms of Reference (TOR). Our audit approach included observation, inquiries, inspections, re-performance, confirmation, and analytical procedures on areas we considered as high risk.

While the audit was not directed at reporting the following, we have reported on the below issues which came to our attention during the course of the audit:

- Non- effective performance of the program - relates to **Management's responsibility** to undertake activities in a non-effective and non-efficient manner.
- Non-delivery of goods and services – **relates to Management's non-exercise** of responsibility to ensure that all goods and services procured are delivered.
- Instances of non-compliance with applicable laws and regulations - relates to **Management's non-exercise** of responsibility to use resources, and fulfill accountability requirements, in accordance with applicable agreements, laws and regulations governing contracts award, goods and service delivery, projects execution, evaluation and reporting.
- Waste – **relates to Management's non-exercise** of responsibility to obtain and apply resources in an economical manner, without any public money being wasted.
- Instances of abuse- relates **to Management's non-** exercise of responsibility to meet the expectations of the National Legislature and the public as they relate to appropriate standards of behavior.

## **Limitation of Responsibility**

We reviewed the systems and management controls operated by the Liberia Institute of Public Administration only to the extent we considered necessary for the effective conduct of this audit. As a result, our review may not have detected all weaknesses that existed or all improvements that could be made.





## **1 DETAILED FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS**

### **1.1 Financial Issues**

#### **1.1.1 Undisclosed Bank Account and Reconciliation**

##### **Observation**

- 1.1.1.1 Regulation I. 19 of the PFM Act of 2009 states that "The Responsibility of the Auditor-General for examining and certifying government accounts does not relieve any officer responsible for keeping and rendering such accounts from the duty to comply and to ensure that subordinates comply with provisions of any enactment, these regulations and with any instructions or directions issued under them."
- 1.1.1.2 Additionally, Regulation R 3.6 of the PFM of 2009 states that, "The balance of every bank account as shown in a bank statement shall be reconciled with the corresponding cashbook balance at least once every month; and the reconciliation statement shall be filed or recorded in the cashbook or the reference to the date and number thereof."
- 1.1.1.3 It was observed during the conduct of the audit that the Management of LIPA failed to disclose in its summary of cash balance in its Ecobank Account (001014700378801) titled Liberia Institute of Public Administration (LIPA). The balance per the bank statement at June 30, 2013 was US\$(96.85).
- 1.1.1.4 Further, there were many inaccuracies observed on the bank reconciliation statements prepared by the LIPA Management. **See table 1 below for detail:**

**Table 1: Bank Reconciliation Analysis\***

<b>Date</b>	<b>Balance per cash book as per reconciliation statement (A) USD</b>	<b>Balance per cash book as per Ledger (B) USD</b>	<b>Variance (C=A-B) USD</b>
May 31, 2013	14,171.37	14,925.67	(754.30)
Jun. 30, 2013	2,632.67	1,962.75	669.92

**\* LBDI - General Account US\$-0221515719103**

##### **Risk**

- 1.1.1.5 The accuracy and completeness of the financial statements could be in doubt in the absence of the non-disclosure of some of the entity's bank accounts.
- 1.1.1.6 Also, disagreements between the cashbook balance per the reconciliation statement and the cashbook balance per the ledger could cast doubt on the accuracy of the bank reconciliation statement prepared by the LIPA Management.

##### **Recommendation**

- 1.1.1.7 The LIPA Management should provide substantive justification for not disclosing the entity's various bank accounts.



1.1.1.8 Additionally, the LIPA Management should provide substantive justification for the variance between the cashbook balance per the reconciliation statement and the cashbook balance per the reconciliation statement.

1.1.1.9 Going forward, the LIPA Management should disclose all financial information including bank account details.

#### **Management's Response**

1.1.1.10 *On August 4, 2016, the GAC requested several documents from LIPA to facilitate the conduct of the audit. **(Please see exhibit- 001)** The request was made for the bank reconciliation statements (this will include active bank accounts, cash book and the reconciled statement). The account at Ecobank was not an active account and was closed since April 30, 2013. **(Please see exhibit- 002)** LIPA management also wish to inform the GAC that the account number reported in the Audit Report is not the correct account number. A bank statement from that account to show the correct account number **(Please see exhibit-003)**.*

1.1.1.11 *In view of the above, LIPA's management supplied all active bank account statement. Management wish to inform the GAC that it did not intentionally fail to disclose the inactive bank account. Management will also like to inform GAC that it can write the Ecobank to provide all bank statement if this is required for further review. Bank reconciliation was a challenge for the institution in 2012/2013 budget year. Upon my taking over, several reforms were fast tracked to address several financial, administrative and financial issues the institute faced with. We have made significant achievement in this regards.*

#### **Auditor General's Position**

1.1.1.12 The request by GAC for the presentation of bank reconciliation statements did not state reconciliation for only active accounts. It is standard financial management requirement to prepare reconciliation for both active and inactive bank accounts as their combined closing balances at the close of the fiscal period should constitute the actual cash balance of the entity. The undisclosed Ecobank Account was obtained by the GAC through confirmation letters issued to various banks requesting banking information of LIPA. There were no bank reconciliation statements prepared for this account and its closing balance was not included in the cash balance at the close of the fiscal period 2013/2014.

1.1.1.13 **Additionally, LIPA Management's** assertion that the undisclosed account reported in the GAC report is "not correct" cannot be materially supported. This account mentioned in the audit report was obtained directly from the bank through our confirmation procedure.

1.1.1.14 Further, LIPA Management failed to address the inaccuracies between its bank reconciliation statements and its cash book. Therefore, the LIPA Management is in breach of Regulation A. 20 of the PFM Act of 2009.



## **1.1.2 Payments without Adequate Supporting Documentation**

### **Observation**

- 1.1.2.1 Regulations P.9 (2) of the PFM Act of 2009 states that "Payments except for statutory transfers and debt service shall be supported by invoices, bills and other documents in addition to the payment vouchers".
- 1.1.2.2 It was observed during the conduct of the audit that payment made for various items in the amount of **US\$11,315.00** (Eleven Thousand, Three Hundred Fifteen United States Dollars) and **L\$371,913.00** (Three Hundred Seventy-One Thousand Nine Hundred Thirteen Liberian Dollars) were without adequate support documentation. **Refer to Appendixes 1 (a), 1 (b) and 1 (c) for details.**
- 1.1.2.3 In addition, the total amounts in **Table 2** were shown as withdrawals from the LBDI Bank Statements for the period under audit and appears not to have been recorded in the entity's cashbook. **See Appendixes 1 (b) and 1 (c) for details**

**Table 2: Unrecorded transactions per Bank Statements**

<b>LBDI Bank Statements Account No.</b>	<b>USD</b>	<b>LRD</b>
0121915719103	7,085.00	
0221515719103		371,913.00

### **Risk**

- 1.1.2.4 The receipt of goods cannot be assured in the absence of supporting documents such as delivery/goods received notes.
- 1.1.2.5 The unrecorded expenditures understates amount expended and undermines transparency and accountability of public resources.

### **Recommendation**

- 1.1.2.6 The LIPA Management should provide the necessary supporting documents for the purchase of the items listed on **Appendix 1 (a), 1 (b) & 1 (c).**
- 1.1.2.7 Going forward, the LIPA Management should ensure that all supporting documentations are attached payment vouchers.

### **Management's Response**

- 1.1.2.8 *This issue will be addressed by previous management. (Please see exhibit 004-1 & 004-2)*

### **Auditor General's Position**

- 1.1.2.9 In the absence of the response by Management, Management is in breach of Regulation A.20. of the PFM Act of 2009.



### **1.1.3 Retirement of Travel Expense**

#### **Observation**

- 1.1.3.1 Count 24 of the **GOL's Travel Ordinance on Foreign Travel** states that "Upon return from abroad, officials are required to submit to the Ministry of Finance, a Travel Settlement Form as per Annexure II within 21 days from the date of return from tour or before date of next journey, whichever is earlier. In very exceptional cases where the second tour is performed immediately after return from the first tour; the second advance may be granted with the specific written approval of the Minister concerned, explaining the reasons thereof."
- 1.1.3.2 Also, Count 25 of the **GOL's Travel Ordinance on Foreign Travel** also states that "No future travel advances shall be paid to anyone who has failed to submit the prescribed Travel Disbursement Form, for any previous journey within 21 days. The entire travel advance will be recovered from those who fail to submit the Travel Settlement Form on return from their visit abroad, and those who subsequently leave the service of the Government, from any arrears due to them by the Government.
- 1.1.3.3 Further, **Count 15 and 16 of the GOL's Travel Ordinance on Domestic Travel** states that "Upon completion of a travel officials are required to submit to the Ministry of Finance THE TRAVEL SETTLEMENT FORM per Annexure II within 21 days of their return. No future domestic travel advance shall be paid to anyone who has failed to submit the prescribed Domestic Travel Settlement Form within 21 days after return from the previous journey."
- 1.1.3.4 Additionally, Section 54 of the amended and restated PPC Act, 2010 states that "Quotations shall be requested in writing from as many bidders as practicable, but from at least three (3) bidders" is required for purchases with threshold of less than US\$10,000".
- 1.1.3.5 It was observed during the conduct of the audit that the LIPA Management made payments to several employees amounting to **US\$14,358.00** (Fourteen Thousand, Three Hundred Fifty-Eight United States Dollars) for daily subsistence and incidental allowances for foreign and domestic travels without evidence that these allowances were retired and/or accounted for.
- 1.1.3.6 Also, it was observed that the LIPA Management did not obtain at least three quotations required to purchase air tickets for travels in compliance with the PPCC Act of 2010. **See table 3 below for details:**

**Table 3: Retirement of Travel Expense**

No.	Date	Payee	Description	Voucher No.	Check No.	Amount (USD)
1	16-Apr-13	Mariama Kamara	Foreign Travel DSA to Europe Finland from Aug.26-31, 2012	0032	1119719	1,000.00
2	12-Sep-12	P. EmMersyn	Local Travel to Gbarnga	0061	1119740	



No.	Date	Payee	Description	Voucher No.	Check No.	Amount (USD)
		Harris				1,460.00
3	20-Sep-12	Jacob D. Davies	Foreign Travel to Ghana	0074	1119751	1,884.00
4	21-Jun-13	Luna M. Harmon	Local Travel cost for three days	0452	NIL	900.00
5	21-Jun-13	Charles G. Jarrett	Foreign Travel Cost	0453	10432	500.00
6	April 18,2018	David K. Swen	Incidental Allowance	0290	39267	2,485.00
7	April 19,2018	Mariama Kamara	Local Incidental Allowance	0320	41709	1,500.00
8	28-Jun-13	Benford Ouire	Local Travel Per diem	0458	10435	200.00
9	17-Aug-12	P. Emmersyn Harris	Local Travel	0024	125283	330.00
10	14-Jun-13	Richard S. Panton	Foreign travel incidental	0431	10554	2,699.00
11	21 June-13	Luna Harmon	Local Travel cost	'0452	10431	900.00
12		Reginald K. Gaye	Incidental Allowance to Ghana	'0417	10543	500.00
<b>Total</b>						<b>US\$14,358.00</b>

### **Risk**

- 1.1.3.7 Failure to retire allowances undermines the accountability of public resources.
- 1.1.3.8 Payments without adequate supporting documentation could cast doubt on the regularity of the transactions and undermine public sector accountability and transparency.

### **Recommendation**

- 1.1.3.9 The LIPA Management should provide material justification for failing to retire foreign and domestic per diem allowances.
- 1.1.3.10 Management should also provide material justification for failing to obtain three quotations from travel agents for air tickets purchased.
- 1.1.3.11 Going forward, the LIPA Management should ensure that foreign and domestic per diem allowances are retired and/or accounted for.
- 1.1.3.12 Also, the LIPA Management should ensure that three quotations are obtained from travel agents for air tickets purchased.

### **Management's Response**

- 1.1.3.13 *LIPA Management acknowledge the General Auditing Commission assertions on "Retirement of Travel Expense" and assures the Auditor General that going forward we will ensure full compliance with the Local and Foreign Travel Ordinance of Government of Liberia.*



### **Auditor General's Position**

- 1.1.3.14 The LIPA Management is required to ensure that all staff members who undertook travels retired timely their travel advances. In the absence of retirement of travel advances, the entire amount should be recovered from those who failed to submit their travel settlement forms. For those who have left LIPA, the entity should also recover the amount from them in line with the travel ordinance.

### **1.1.4 Payments to Third Party**

#### **Observation**

- 1.1.4.1 Regulation B. 28 of the PFM Act of 2009 states that "A payment shall be made only to the person or persons named on the payment voucher or to their representatives duly and legally authorized in writing to receive the payment."

- 1.1.4.2 It was observed during the conduct of the audit that the LIPA Management made multiple payments amounting to **US\$54,238.00** (Fifty Four Thousand Two Hundred Thirty-Eight United States Dollars) to several individuals and/or employees of the entity rather than the service providers. **Refer to Appendix 2 for details:**

#### **Risk**

- 1.1.4.3 Checks issued in the names of individuals and/or employees could be diverted to personal use thus leading to misappropriation of funds.

#### **Recommendation**

- 1.1.4.4 The LIPA Management should provide substantive justification for authorizing payments in the names of individuals who did not directly provide goods and services.
- 1.1.4.5 Going forward, the LIPA Management should refrain from making payments to individuals and/or employees who did not directly provide goods and services to the entity.

#### **Management's Response**

- 1.1.4.6 *LIPA is a training institute that provides services to both the private and public sectors. Most of the training for public or private institutions are conducted in the counties which require DSA or attendees fees which covers hotel accommodation and or feeding. Because the participants at most time not from LIPA but various institutions, it is not possible to prepare checks for all of them until the start of the training. The actual attendees are provided DSA allowance / per Diem. The cashier/Finance officer accompanies the training team is and disburse funds to participants and provide the payment and other relevant documentation to justify the disbursement. These payments are done by finance staff due to the number of participants. PFM Regulation B28 "A payment shall be made only to a person or persons named on the payment voucher or their representatives duly and legally authorized in writing to receive payments". All payments were made to payee stated on the voucher for various activities and programs to implement even though some payee didn't match the description. However, LIPA's management acknowledge the party payment issues and going forward we will ensure it is in compliance.*



### **Auditor General's Position**

- 1.1.4.7 Management's assertion is not materially supported and cannot be sustained on the merit. Management should have written DSA checks and payments for goods and services in the names of the participants and service providers. Management provided no evidence that it was legally authorized to make these payments to LIPA employees for onward distributions. Further, we did not see any evidence that these payments were received by the intended beneficiaries. Therefore, the Management of LIPA is in breach of Regulation A.20 of the PFM Act of 2009, as such all LIPA staff members who received these payments as shown in Appendix 2 should be held accountable for the amounts.

## **1.1.5 Preparation of Financial Statements**

### **Observation**

- 1.1.5.1 Paragraph 1.3.4 of International Public Sector Accounting Standard (IPSAS) Cash Basis of accounting requires that entity should prepare and present general purpose financial statements which include the following components:
- a) A statement of cash receipts and payments which:
    - b) (i) Recognizes all cash receipts, cash payments and cash balances controlled by the entity; and
    - c) (ii) Separately identifies payments made by third parties on behalf of the entity in accordance with paragraph 1.3.24 of this Standard;
    - d) Accounting policies and explanatory notes; and
    - e) When the entity makes publicly available its approved budget, a comparison of budget and actual amounts either as a separate additional financial statements or as a budget column in the statement of cash receipts and payments in accordance with paragraph 1.9.8 of this Standard.

- 1.1.5.2 It was observed during the conduct of the audit that the LIPA Management did not prepare and present financial statements in accordance with the Cash Basis International Public Sector Accounting Standards (IPSAS), standards as adopted by the Government of Liberia.

### **Risk**

- 1.1.5.3 **The failure to prepare financial statements based on GoL's adopted financial reporting framework could undermine Government efforts to strengthen financial accountability and control over public receipts and expenditure.**

### **Recommendation**

- 1.1.5.4 The LIPA Management should provide substantive justification for not preparing financial statements in accordance with IPSAS Cash Basis.



- 1.1.5.5 Going forward, the LIPA Management should prepare and present financial statements in accordance with IPSAS Cash Basis.

#### **Management's Response**

- 1.1.5.6 *The training for Government of Liberia Financial Officers to prepare IPSAS Financial Statements began in 2012 through 2013. The preparation of Financial Statement was not possible while Budget and Finance office was undergoing training.*

#### **Auditor General's Position**

- 1.1.5.7 The LIPA Management's **assertion that the** Government of Liberia Financial Officers were undergoing IPSAS cash basis Financial Statements training is not an excuse for non-preparation of the financial statements. The 2012/2013 financial statements should have been prepared and submitted within two months after the close of the 2012/2013 fiscal year in line with Regulation 1.11 of the PFM Act of 2009. Meaning, Management should have prepared the financial statements July and August 2013, the 2013/2014 fiscal year. Therefore, the LIPA Management is in breach of Regulation A.20 of the PFM Act of 2009.

### **1.1.6 Checks written out of Numerical Sequence**

#### **Observation**

- 1.1.6.1 Regulation A.3 (1) of the Public Financial Management (PFM) Act of 2009 states that **"Any public officer concerned with** the conduct of financial matters of the Government of Liberia, or the receipt, custody and disbursement of public and trust moneys, or for the custody, care and use of government stores and inventories shall keep books of accounts and proper records of all transactions and shall produce the books of accounts and records of the transactions for inspection when called upon to do so by the Auditor General, the Comptroller General, the relevant internal auditor or any officers authorized by them, by the Minister".

- 1.1.6.2 It was observed during the conduct of the audit that the LIPA Management wrote and issued checks to vendors out of numerical sequence.

- 1.1.6.3 It was also observed that Twenty-five (25) checks were missing from the numerical sequence of checks recorded in **the entity's cashbook for the period audited. Further,** there was no evidence that checks written out of sequence were canceled and/or voided by the LIPA Management. Copies of the missing checks were requested but were not provided. **See Appendix 3 for details:**

#### **Risk**

- 1.1.6.4 Writing checks out of sequence could result in checks being written fraudulently.

#### **Recommendation**

- 1.1.6.5 The LIPA Management should provide material justification for writing and issuing checks out of numerical sequence.





1.1.6.6 The LIPA Management should provide copies of the checks that are missing from the sequence of checks recorded in the cashbook.

1.1.6.7 Going forward, the LIPA Management should make sure that checks to vendors are written in sequence and if voided should be maintained.

### **Management's Response**

1.1.6.8 *During the period under review, the Liberia Institute of Public Administration has had series of transactions which also involves voided checks in the process and the voided checks were not posted into the cash book. Therefore the numbers of the voided checks were not reflected in the cash book sequentially because of the voided checks.*

### **Auditor General's Position**

1.1.6.9 The LIPA Management did not make available copies of the voided checks as evidence. Therefore, Management is in breach of Regulation A.20 of the PFM Act of 2009.

## **1.1.7 Petty Cash**

### **Observation**

1.1.7.1 Regulation B.33 (4) of the PFM Act of 2009 states that "the maximum amount that may be held as petty cash in any one calendar month is the equivalent of United States Dollars Two Hundred".

1.1.7.2 It was noted during the conduct of the audit that the LIPA Management did not have a policy on petty cash and therefore, **were subjected to the GOL's Petty Cash Threshold** as established by the amended and restated PFM Act.

1.1.7.3 Further, we observed that multiple petty cash replenishment requests exceeded the required threshold of **US\$200.00** monthly and management failed to provide the petty cash replenishment report with the supporting transactions details. **Refer to table 4 for details:**

**Table 4: Petty Cash**

<b>No.</b>	<b>Date</b>	<b>Payee</b>	<b>Description</b>	<b>Check #</b>	<b>LIPA Amount A (USD)</b>	<b>GOL Approved Amount B (USD)</b>	<b>Variance (A-B) (USD)</b>
1.	24-Oct-12	Harris F. Tarnue	Petty Cash for Research Department	1119771	300.00	200.00	100.00
2.	25-Oct-12	Konah B. Jah	Petty Cash for Central Administration	1119777	300.00	200.00	100.00
3.	5-Dec-12	William B. Buxton II	Petty Cash For Training Department	41619	300.00	200.00	100.00
4.	12-Nov-12	Christian	Petty Cash	125308		200.00	100.00



No.	Date	Payee	Description	Check #	LIPA Amount A (USD)	GOL Approved Amount B (USD)	Variance (A-B) (USD)
		T. G. Tabla	for Director General		300.00		
<b>Total</b>					<b>US\$1,200.0</b>	<b>US\$800.00</b>	<b>US\$400.00</b>

### **Risk**

- 1.1.7.4 Failure to develop a petty cash policy could lead to abuse of public resources.
- 1.1.7.5 Exceeding the petty cash threshold established by the PFM Regulation is a violation and could lead to the misappropriation of the funds.

### **Recommendation**

- 1.1.7.6 The LIPA Management should provide substantive justification for exceeding the petty cash threshold established by the PFM Regulation.
- 1.1.7.7 Going forward, the LIPA Management should ensure that the provisions of the PFM Act and its regulation are adhered to unconditionally.

### **Management's Response**

- 1.1.7.8 *LIPA's Management has instituted many reforms to help promote effective Public Financial Management at the institute. While the current management is not aware of the decisions made by previous administration we are glad to inform you that we have completed a petty cash policy that has been approved by management. (Please see exhibit -005).*

### **Auditor General's Position**

- 1.1.7.9 We acknowledge the petty cash policy developed by Management. However, during the 2012/2013 fiscal year, Management did have a petty cash policy in place. Therefore, Management is in breach of Regulation A.20 of the PFM Act of 2009.

## **1.2 Compliance Issues**

### **1.2.1 Payroll Irregularities**

#### **Observation**

- 1.2.1.1 Regulation T.5 (1) of PFM Act, 2009 states that, "A Head of government agency shall cause the immediate stoppage of payment of salary to a public servant when that public servant has: (a) been absent from duty without permission or reasonable cause for a period as stipulated in the administrative regulations of the establishment; (b) been absent from duty on leave without pay; (c) been convicted of an offence involving theft or fraud, or a sentence of imprisonment; (d) resigned; (e) retired; or (f) died".



1.2.1.2 It was observed during the conduct of the audit that a staff who died and a staff who resigned, respectively, names were still being maintained on LIPA's Payroll. **See table 5 below for details:**

**Table 5: Payroll Irregularities**

Name	Position	Payroll #	Date of Death/Resignation	Trace to Payroll After Statutory Period (death Only)	Gross Salary (LRD)	No. of Months on Payroll	Total Gross Salary (LRD)
Harold J. Monger	Director General	13-01-001-0039	Jan. 11, 2013 (Dead)	(May & Jun. 2013)	16,317.00	2	32,634.00
Princess R. Clinton	Webmaster	13-01-599-0010	May 10, 2013 (Resigned)	(May- Aug. 2013)	8,530.00	4	34,120.00
<b>Total</b>							<b>\$66,754.00</b>

1.2.1.3 Additionally, from the sample tested it was observed that twenty (20) employees of the entity appear not to have signed out daily per the attendance log to ascertain that they worked the required eight (8) hours daily. **Refer to Appendix 4 for details.**

1.2.1.4 Further, it was observed that the daily attendance log was not being regularly monitored by a designated staff.

**Risk**

1.2.1.5 Paying salary to employee who had died or resigned could result to unjust salary to ghost employee.

1.2.1.6 Also, failure to monitor and supervise personnel attendance records may result to compensation to none deserving employees.

**Recommendation**

1.2.1.7 The Management should provide material justification for paying salary to employees who had died or resigned.

1.2.1.8 The Management should provide material justification **for failing to monitor employees' attendance records.**

1.2.1.9 Further, Management should ensure that personnel attendance records are regularly monitored by a designated staff.

1.2.1.10 Going forward, the LIPA Management should refrain from paying salaries to employees who do not report to work without excuse (s).



### **Management's Response**

- 1.2.1.11 *LIPA's management has the authority to immediately remove any employee who is dismissed or abandon his/her job in violation of the HR Policy and Civil Service Standing from the Special or General Allowance. However, the process to remove or replace a Civil Servant from the payroll is within the purview of the Civil Service Agency through the Personnel Action Notice.*

### **Auditor General's Position**

- 1.2.1.12 Management did not provide any evidence that it communicated with the CSA to remove deceased or separated employee from the payroll. Therefore, Management is accountable for the payment of salaries to employees that are no longer employed with LIPA.

## **1.2.2 Fixed Assets Management**

### **Observation**

- 1.2.2.1 Regulation V.4 of the PFM Act of 2009 states that "Furniture, and equipment issued for Government quarters or offices or vehicle and other fixed asset shall be brought on a master inventory of the Government Agency".

- 1.2.2.2 It was observed during the conduct of the audit that the LIPA Management did not maintain fixed assets registry that would show a list of coded assets, date of purchase, cost, location, assignee and current condition.

### **Risk**

- 1.2.2.3 In the absence of fixed assets listing, the ownership and existence of the entity's assets cannot be assured and can be susceptible to theft.

### **Recommendation**

- 1.2.2.4 The LIPA Management should provide material justification for not providing fixed assets listings for all assets acquired for the period under audit.

- 1.2.2.5 Going forward, the LIPA Management should maintain fixed assets listing for all assets acquired and disposed for the period under audit.

- 1.2.2.6 Additionally, proper fixed assets internal controls policies and procedures aligned with PFM Regulation should be adopted and implemented for the maintenance of fixed assets.

### **Management's Response**

- 1.2.2.7 *LIPA maintain a fixed Asset Registry which has been updated. However the fixed asset registry is not comprehensive with lack of information on cost date of purchase and location. These issues were also brought up in an internal managerial system review (Risk Assessment) and Finance & Procurement divisions are currently updating the needed information. LIPA has been working closely with the GSA on fully updating the*



*master registry. Going forward all assets processed by or donated to LIPA will be recorded with all information on the fixed asset registry. Prior to this period under review, there was no Asset Registry at the Institution. In collaboration with the USAID-GEMS project, an appropriate Registry has been developed and all assets are currently logged. This is a trend the Institution hopes to continue.*

### **Auditor General's Position**

- 1.2.2.8 We accept Management's acknowledgement of our findings and its assertion that the GSA is updating LIPA fixed assets registry. However, the LIPA Management is in breach of Regulation A. 20 of the PFM Act of 2009.

### **1.2.3 Policies and Procedures**

#### **Observation**

- 1.2.3.1 The Committee of Supporting Organization of the Treadway Commission (COSO) internal control framework on control activities stipulates that, "Institutions deploy control activities through policies that establish what is expected and procedures that put policies into action". Policies and procedures are established and implemented to help ensure that risk responses are effectively carried out within an entity.

- 1.2.3.2 It was observed during the conduct of the audit that the LIPA Management did not develop and/or communicate policies, guidance or procedures on the following activities:

- Accounting Manual
- Accounts Reconciliation
- Petty Cash
- Scholarship procedures and processing
- Internal Controls

#### **Risk**

- 1.2.3.3 The lack of policies and procedures to regulate activities may lead to discretionary decisions and abuse of public funds.

#### **Recommendation**

- 1.2.3.4 The LIPA Management should provide material justification for failing to institute policies and procedures to guide the activities.
- 1.2.3.5 Going forward, the LIPA Management should ensure that policies and procedures are put in place to guide the activities.

#### **Management's Response**

- 1.2.3.6 *Hon. Oblayon B. Nyemah took over the mantle of authority at the Institute on April 1, 2013 almost at the end of the budget year. He continued and fast tracked the reform process at the Institute initiated by the previous administration and USAID-GEM. Staff were trained and policies were developed and adopted senior management. **(Please see exhibit 016, 005 & 008 Policy Manual, Petty Cash Policy and Training & Development Policy)** I am pleased to inform you that LIPA has an approved (Policy*



*Manual) which covers policy, administrative, financial and operational issues. A petty cash policy has been reviewed and approved. Management will ensure that all procedure in those policies are fully adhered to.*

#### **Auditor General's Position**

- 1.2.3.7 We acknowledge the "Policy Manual, Petty Cash Policy and Training & Development Policy" developed by Management. Management should also develop other relevant policy documents for the smooth operation of LIPA.

#### **1.2.4 Internal Audit Unit**

##### **Observation**

- 1.2.4.1 Regulation J 3 (1) of the PFM Act of 2009 requires each Government Agency or Organization to establish an Internal Audit Unit to constitute part of that institution.
- 1.2.4.2 It was observed during the conduct of the audit that there was no evidence of internal audit function to monitor and/or evaluate the systems and controls at LIPA.

##### **Risk**

- 1.2.4.3 The lack of periodic review of the financial management activities of an organization by an internal audit unit may lead to internal control weaknesses not being identified on a timely basis for corrective actions to be taken.

##### **Recommendation**

- 1.2.4.4 The LIPA Management should provide material justification for failing to establish internal audit function at LIPA.
- 1.2.4.5 Going forward, the LIPA Management should establish an internal audit to monitor and/or evaluate the flow of business transactions at LIPA.

##### **Management's Response**

- 1.2.4.6 *As part of management's ongoing reform system the setting up of the Internal Audit Unit in the Institute was paramount. The Internal Audit Agency established by law to administer internal audit functions in branches of government was written by management to help establish the internal audit function (Unit) in LIPA. The Internal Audit Unit is now establish and commenced the review of our system and making recommendation for improvement. It is our hope with the current reform, LIPA will have an improve financial management system during your nest review. I have attached several communications between the Internal Audit Agency and Liberia Institute of Public Administration to verify my assertion of a functional unit. **(Please see exhibit 006-1 to 006-6).***

##### **Auditor General's Position**

- 1.2.4.7 We acknowledge Management's assertion that it has engaged the Internal Audit Agency to review LIPA's internal control systems and make recommendations. During the 2012/2013 fiscal year, LIPA did not have a functional internal audit unit in place. Therefore, Management is in breach of Regulation A.20 of the PFM Act of 2009.



## **1.2.5 Lack of Designated Account**

### **Observation**

1.2.5.1 Regulation B.8 (1 and 2) of PFM Act, states that "All public moneys collected and retained by a government agency, shall be paid in gross into the designated bank accounts and no use shall be made by any public officer of monies collected in any manner between the time of its receipts and payment into the bank except as provided by an enactment. A Government agency that has legislative approval to retain all or a portion of Internally Generated Funds collected, must first lodge the retained Internally Generated Funds in gross into the Government agency's operational bank account before using the Government agency's disbursement process to spend it."

1.2.5.2 It was observed during the audit that LIPA appears not to have a designated account to collect and deposit training fees. Further, it appears fees are generally deposited in all accounts maintained by the entity such as LBDI, FIB (now GN) and the Central Banks.

### **Risk**

1.2.5.3 Failure to collect and retain internally generated funds into a designated account could lead to misappropriation and abuse of public resources.

### **Recommendation**

1.2.5.4 The LIPA Management should provide material justification for failing to collect and retain internally generated funds into a designated operational account.

1.2.5.5 Going forward, the LIPA Management should ensure that all funds collected shall be paid **in gross into a designated account and disbursed in line with the entity's disbursement process.**

### **Management's Response**

1.2.5.6 *LIPA has a designated account for students to deposit training fees. The designated account is the FIB (now GN Bank). The account title is: Liberia Institute of Public Administration with account number (0011201493001). Students are to complete application form and obtain a provisional admission letter with student fees stated. Letter is taken to the Budget & Finance Office and obtain a deposit slip. **(Please see attached exhibit-007-1 & 007-2)** The deposit slip indicated the name of the bank, account title and name of depositor. That is the only account designated for students fees.*

### **Auditor General's Position**

1.2.5.7 Management's assertion is not materially supported. Documents provided by Management confirmed that LIPA tuition and fees were generally deposited at LBDI, FIB (now GN) and the Central Banks. Management should establish a designated account for the deposit of all tuition and fees. Therefore, Management is in breach of Regulation A.20 of the PFM Act of 2009.



## **1.2.6 No Policy for Honorarium**

### **Observation**

1.2.6.1 The Committee of Supporting Organization of the Treadway Commission (COSO) internal control framework on control activities stipulates that **"Institutions deploy control activities through policies that establish what is expected and procedures that put policies into action"**. **Policies and procedures are established and implemented to help ensure that risk responses are effectively carried out within an entity.**

1.2.6.2 It was observed during the conduct of the audit that the LIPA Management made payment for honorarium to employees and internal facilitators amounting to **US\$8,490.00** (Eight Thousand Four Hundred Ninety United States Dollars and **L\$46,300.00** (Forty-Six Thousand Three Hundred United States Dollars without evidence of a formal policy. **Refer to Appendix 5.**

### **Risk**

1.2.6.3 The lack of policies and procedures may lead to discretionary decisions and abuse of public funds.

### **Recommendation**

1.2.6.4 The LIPA Management should provide material justification for failing to institute policies and procedures to guide the payment of honorarium.

1.2.6.5 Going forward, the LIPA Management should ensure that policies and procedures are put in place to guide the payment of honorarium.

### **Management's Response**

1.2.6.6 *LIPA has developed several policies to help safe guard public funds and at the same time ensure consistency and accountability. LIPA has developed and adopted the "policy and procedures for the Training & Manpower Development". This document among other things addresses the standard for paying facilitator and the payment of honorarium. (Please see exhibit 008, Section 8.0 "Payment as Honorarium").*

### **Auditor General's Position**

1.2.6.7 Management presented a **"policy and procedures for the Training & Manpower Development"** without evidence that it has been approved and adopted. There is no date of approval and the approving authority's signature. **Therefore, the Management should approve and adopt the policy to make it effective.**

## **1.2.7 Consulting Facilitators**

### **Observation**

1.2.7.1 Section 41(1) (a-e) of the amended and restated PPC Act of 2010 states that **"the Procuring Entity shall be responsible for the administration and monitoring of contracts entered into by the Entity. The contract administration functions shall include at least the following:**





- Ensuring that the contractor complies with the specifications and terms of the contract;
- Ensuring that the contract is being performed on schedule;
- Ensuring that payments made to the contractor are in accordance with the terms of the contract.
- Determining when a contract has been successfully performed which will entitle the contractor to final payment; and
- In the case of each contract awarded by the Procuring Entity, designating a contract administration officer who will have responsibility for the administration of the contract consistently with **the requirements of this Act and the regulations.**"

1.2.7.2 It was observed during the conduct of the audit that the LIPA Management hired the services of consultants/facilitators for the period audited without evidence of a formal contract agreement. **See table below 6 for details:**

**Table 6 – Consultants/Facilitators without Contracts**

FIRST NAME	INITIAL	LAST NAME	COURSE FACILITATED
Jamilatus	J	Konneh	Records Management
Francis		Dennis	Banking & Finance
Teakon		Williams	Project Planning
Nathaniel	C	Bestman	Internal Control

1.2.7.3 Additionally, there was no evidence that the consultants/ facilitators had reported to work as the daily attendance log provided by the LIPA Management did not indicate time sign-in and time sign-out.

**Risk**

1.2.7.4 Failure to maintain contract agreement between consulting facilitators and the LIPA Management undermines public sector accountability and transparency.

**Recommendation**

1.2.7.5 The LIPA Management should provide material justification for failing to maintain or provide a contract agreement for consultants/facilitators.

1.2.7.6 Going forward, the LIPA Management should ensure that contract agreements are signed and maintained for consultants/facilitators.

**Management's Response**

1.2.7.7 *The management of LIPA, under my leadership has always maintained formal contact agreement with all its facilitators. The issue of consulting facilitators not having contracts is actually one which emanated from my predecessor.*

**Auditor General's Position**

1.2.7.8 There were no contracts for facilitators during the 2012/2013 fiscal year. Therefore,



Management should be held accountable for breach of Section 41(1) (a-e) of the amended and restated PPC Act of 2010.

### **1.2.8 Fuel and Lubricant**

#### **Observation**

- 1.2.8.1 Section 46 (1 and 3) of the amended and Restated Public Procurement & Concession Commission Act of 2010 states that, **"(1) Public procurement shall be undertaken by means of advertised open bid proceedings, to which equal access shall be provided to all eligible and qualified bidders without discrimination, subject only to the exceptions provided under this Part for particular methods of procurement. (3) Procuring Entities may use only those methods of procurement authorized by this Act. If a Procuring Entity uses a method of procurement other than advertised open competitive bidding, it shall note in the record of the procurement proceedings the grounds for the choice of the procurement method."**
- 1.2.8.2 It was observed during the conduct of the audit that the LIPA Management made multiple payments for the procurement of fuel and lubricant in the amount of **US\$48,054.62** (Forty-Eight Thousand Fifty-Four United States Dollars & Sixty-Two Cents) without evidence of an Open Competitive Bidding Process. **Refer to Appendix 6 for details.**
- 1.2.8.3 Also, there was no evidence of Procurement Committee report, bid evaluation report and contract agreement between the LIPA Management and the service providers for the procurement of fuel and lubricant.

#### **Risk**

- 1.2.8.4 Non-adherence to the PPC Act could undermine competitive procurement process and value for money may not be achieved.

#### **Recommendation**

- 1.2.8.5 The LIPA Management should provide material justification for procuring fuel and lubricant without evidence of an open and competitive bidding process.
- 1.2.8.6 The LIPA Management should provide contract agreement with the service providers.
- 1.2.8.7 Going forward, the LIPA Management should adhere to the amended and restated PPC Act of 2010, specifically section 41 (1 and 3).

#### **Management's Response**

- 1.2.8.8 *This issue will be addressed by previous management. (Please see exhibit 004-1 & 004-2).*

#### **Auditor General's Position**

- 1.2.8.9 In the absence of a response by Management, Management is in breach of Section 46 (1 and 3) of the amended and Restated Public Procurement & Concession Commission Act of 2010.



## **1.2.9 Retirement of Employee**

### **Observation**

- 1.2.9.1 Chapter 3, Section 5 (1 and 2) of the Standing Orders for the Civil Service of the Republic of Liberia stipulates that "Unless ordered otherwise by Government, every employee shall be compulsorily retired at the age of 65, or after a minimum of 25 years of service as specified under Section 1 of the Government Employees Pension Act. The Agency Heads shall submit at quarterly intervals to the Director General a list of all employees who are due for retirement. Agency Heads shall ensure that such details are submitted to the Director General at least 3 months prior to the date of retirement of the employee concerned. A list recording details of all retired Civil Servants throughout the Civil Service shall be maintained by the Director-General".
- 1.2.9.2 It was observed during the audit that an employee appears to have reached the retirement age and was still on the entity's payroll. **See table 7 below for details:**

**Table 7: Retirement of Employee**

<b>NAME OF EMPLOYEE</b>	<b>DATE OF BIRTH</b>	<b>DATE HIRED</b>
Joseph Howard	July 1, 1945	Sept. 1, 2004

### **Risk**

- 1.2.9.3 Maintaining employee above the retirement age could result to ineffectiveness and lack of productivity.

### **Recommendation**

- 1.2.9.4 The Management of LIPA should retire its employee(s) who had reached the age for retirement on a timely basis, so as to improve efficiency and effectiveness on the job for the benefit of the institution.

### **Management's Response**

- 1.2.9.5 *This issue will be addressed by previous management. (Please see exhibit 004-1 & 004-2).*

### **Auditor General's Position**

- 1.2.9.6 In the absence of the response by Management, Management is in breach of Chapter 3, Section 5 (1 and 2) of the Standing Orders of the Civil Service.



## **2 ACKNOWLEDGEMENT**

- 2.1 We acknowledge the cooperation and assistance provided to the GAC Audit Team by the Management and staff of the Liberia Institute of Public Administration during the audit. The efforts and commitment of GAC staff in conducting this audit are also gratefully acknowledged.

  
**Yusador S. Gaye, CPA, CGMA**  
**Auditor General. R.L.**

**Monrovia, Liberia**  
**July, 2017**



## **APPENDICES**



**Appendix 1a: Payment without Adequate Supporting Documentation**

No.	Date	Payee	Description	Voucher No.	Check No.	Amount	Missing Documentation
1	9-Jul-12	Nathaniel Tekay	Repair vehicle	0001217	1119699	125.00	Three Quotations
2	9-Jul-12	Sethi Brothers Inc.	Repair Building	0001218	1119700	236.00	Delivery/Good Received
3	28-Aug-12	Unasa Cebe	Repair vehicle	0034	1119721	1,000.00	Three Quotations,
4	28-Aug-12	GESCO	Repair vehicle	0037	1119724	515.00	Delivery/Goods Received
5	18-Sep-12	Jet Auto Services	Repair vehicle	0073	1119748	306.00	Three Quotations
6	18-Apr-13	Jet Auto Services	Repairs Vehicles	2296	41696	280.00	Delivery/Goods Received
7	5-Apr-13	Auto Spare Service	Repairs & Maint. Vehicle	0265	41673	130.00 130.00	Delivery/Goods Received Note
8	5-Apr-13	Feimoh Kpandeh	Repairs & Maint. Vehicle	0264	41672	100.00 100.00	Three Quotations
9	19-Mar-13	Jet Auto Services	Repair vehicle	0234	125273	220.00	Three Quotations
10	5-Apr-13	Jet Auto Services	Repair & Maint Vehicle	0260	41670	1,343.00 1,345.00	Three Quotations
<b>Total</b>						<b>US\$4,257.00</b>	

**Appendix 1b: Payments extracted from LBDI Bank Statement without adequate supporting documentation**

No.	Transaction Date	Payee/Description	Check /Reference #	Transaction Amount (USD)	Missing Documentation
1	18-Jul-12	CHECK WITHDRAWAL	1119701	285.00	Payment Request, Payment Voucher, Copy of Check
2	14-Jul-12	CHECK WITHDRAWAL	1119705	362.00	Payment Request, Payment Voucher, Copy of Check
3	1-Sep-12	RECD FRM CLRG	1119724	515.00	Payment Request, Payment Voucher, Copy of Check
4	1-Sep-12	CHECK WITHDRAWAL	1119729	590.00	Payment Request, Payment Voucher, Copy of Check
5	4-Sep-12	RECD FRM CLRG	CK#1119722	545.00	Payment Request, Payment Voucher, Copy of Check
6	4-Sep-12	LIB INST PUBLIC ADM (UNASA CE	CK ENCH #1119721	1,000.00	Payment Request, Payment



*Auditor General's Report on the Audit Of The Liberia Institute of Public Administration (LIPA)  
For the Period July 1, 2012 to June 30, 2013*

No.	Transaction Date	Payee/Description	Check /Reference #	Transaction Amount (USD)	Missing Documentation
					Voucher, Copy of Check
7	5-Sep-12	RECD FRM CLRG	CK#11109725	300.00	Payment Request, Payment Voucher, Copy of Check
8	5-Sep-12	RECD FRM CLRG	CK#1119728	680.00	Payment Request, Payment Voucher, Copy of Check
9	6-Sep-12	RECD FRM CLRG	CK#1119727	235.00	Payment Request, Payment Voucher, Copy of Check
10	4-Oct-12	CHECK WITHDRAWAL	1119762	109.00	Payment Request, Payment Voucher, Copy of Check
11	5-Oct-12	CHECK WITHDRAWAL	1119763	50.00	Payment Request, Payment Voucher, Copy of Check
12	6-Oct-12	RECD FRM CLRG DD	CK#1119761	270.00	Payment Request, Payment Voucher, Copy of Check
13	8-Oct-12	RECD FRM CLRG	CK#1119760	250.00	Payment Request, Payment Voucher, Copy of Check
14	16-Oct-12	RECD FRM CLRG	CK#1119759	130.00	Payment Request, Payment Voucher, Copy of Check
15	18-Oct-12	RECD FRM CLRG	CK#1119767	430.00	Payment Request, Payment Voucher, Copy of Check
16	18-Oct-12	CASH WITHDRAWAL	1119677	75.00	Payment Request, Payment Voucher, Copy of Check
17	25-Oct-12	LBDI CK#1119769 DEP	1119769	532.00	Payment Request, Payment Voucher, Copy of Check
18	2-Apr-13	RECD FRM CLRG	CK#41651	700.00	Payment Request, Payment Voucher, Copy of Check
<b>Total</b>				<b>US\$7,058.00</b>	



**Appendix 1c: Payments extracted from LBDI Bank Statements without adequate supporting documentations**

No.	Transaction Date	Check / Reference #	Transaction Amount (LRD)	Missing Documentation
1	19-Jul-12	1136017	16,080.00	Payment Request, Payment Voucher, Copy of Check(s)
2	20-Jul-12	1136020	20,100.00	Payment Request, Payment Voucher, Copy of Check(s)
3	12-Jun-13	1136051	129,630.00	Payment Request, Payment Voucher, Copy of Check(s)
4	12-Jun-13	1136050	74,500.00	Payment Request, Payment Voucher, Copy of Check(s)
5	27-Jun-13	1136059	26,075.00	Payment Request, Payment Voucher, Copy of Check(s)
6	30-Aug-13	1136061	105,528.00	Payment Request, Payment Voucher, Copy of Check(s)
<b>Total</b>			<b>L\$371,913.00</b>	

**Appendix 2: Payments made to Third Party**

No.	Date	Description	Third Party	Check No.	Amount (USD)
1	3-Jul-12	Scratch Cards for Internet Services	Frances Jarsayway	125217	1,225.00
2	20-Jul-12	Printing work done for LIPA	Sando Gono	125224	260.00
3	19-Oct-12	Payment of Catering Service	Luna Harmon	125293	4,500.00
4	12-Nov-12	Professional service for plan Liberia	Christian T. G. Tabla	125301	5,650.00
5	12-Nov-12	Repair work done on the Building	Nathaniel Tekay	125309	170.00
6	21-Aug-12	Purchase of Lunch for 20persons on the review Exercise	Christian T.G. Tabla	125287	200.00
7	31-Aug-12	Payment for Catering Services	Tarnie E. Omoko	125289	7,500.00
8	23-Feb-13	APM Terminals staff development training	Hysten Togba	125257	560.00
9	23-Feb-13	Catering services for ASCON TOT Training	Tarnie E. Omoko	125258	2,000.00
10	28-Feb-13	Entertainment for ASCON delegate	Mariama Kamara	125264	300.00
11	4-Mar-13	Lunch for International women day	Pearl J. L. Brent	125266	360.00
12	7-Mar-13	Lunch for 2013/2014 budget workshop	Sensee Ernst	125267	200.00
13	14-Mar-13	Catering service for developing LIPA Modules	Luna Harmon	125268	1,800.00
14	26-Mar-13	Payment of Publicity, Hall Decoration, LEC &	Christian T.G. Tabla	41654	975.00





*Auditor General's Report on the Audit Of The Liberia Institute of Public Administration (LIPA)*

*For the Period July 1, 2012 to June 30, 2013*

<b>No.</b>	<b>Date</b>	<b>Description</b>	<b>Third Party</b>	<b>Check No.</b>	<b>Amount (USD)</b>
		Installation of flat Screen			
15	29-Mar-13	Catering service for the AU Guest	Luna Harmon	N/A	1,700.00
16	2-May-13	Hall Rental for LIPA Anniversary	Reginald K. Gaye	39280	350.00
17	5-Jun-13	Entertainment for ASCON Guest	Beford Quie	10519	850.00
18	7-Jun-13	Pledge made by the DG to the Youth for Democratic Involvement	Beford Quie	10539	500.00
19	14-Jun-13	Amount represents payment of entertainment of the DG's guess	Beford Quie	10552	2,500.00
20	14-Jun-13	Amount represents payment of entertainment of the DG's Guess	Beford Quie	10552	2,500.00
21	5-Sep-12	Entertainment for the three Deputies	Frances S. Jarsayway	1119732	322.00
22	5-Sep-12	Entertainment for the DG office	Christian T.G.Tabla	1119731	248.50
23	11-Sep-12	Purchase of GPRS Refill	Frances S. Jarsayway	1119738	1,140.00
24	18-Sep-12	Purchase of Card for communication Purposes	Varney Folley	1119747	400.00
25	19-Mar-13	Purchase of assorted goods for DG office	Kukor J. Greene	41645	308.00
26	19-Mar-13	Repair of RL-2665	Feimoh Kpandeh	41647	150.00
27	2-May-13	Part-payment for ASCON Team in Bassa	Christian T.G.Tabla	41711	1,500.00
28	7-May-13	Miscellaneous Expense	Lawuo M. Mulbah	41716	1,300.00
29	7-May-13	ASCON Advance Funding	Christian T.G.Tabla	41718	1,000.00
30	8-May-13	Payment for LIPA's sport materials	Reginald K. Gaye	41724	2,125.00
31	8-May-13	Payment to facilitate IT staff training	William B. Buxton II	41731	300.00
32	10-May-13	Payment for media coverage for the 3th cycle closing program	Christian T.G.Tabla	41732	370.00
33	10-May-13	Payment for ASCON guests entertainment	Lawuo M. Mulbah	41733	4,000.00
34	10-May-13	Payment to implement LIPA-ASCON final program	Gus Freeman	41735	4,500.00
35	15-May-13	Payment for hall rental and catering service for the retreat	Pearl Brent	47142	175.00



No.	Date	Description	Third Party	Check No.	Amount (USD)
36	15-May-13	Payment for hall rental and catering service for the retreat	Pearl Brent	47142	1,300.00
37	24-May-13	Purchase of assorted materials for the institute	Luna Harmon	10521	1,000.00
<b>Total</b>					<b>US\$54,238.00</b>

**Appendix 3: Checks written out of Numerical Sequence**

No.	Missing Check #	Account Title	Account #
1	1136028	LBDI General Liberia Dollar	'0121915719103
2	1119758	LBDI GENERAL USD	'002USD1515719103
3	1119778	LBDI GENERAL USD	'002USD1515719103
4	1119779	LBDI GENERAL USD	'002USD1515719103
5	125314	LBDI Special Project Account	'002USD1515719106
6	125329	LBDI Special Project Account	'002USD1515719106
7	125330	LBDI Special Project Account	'002USD1515719106
8	125331	LBDI Special Project Account	'002USD1515719106
9	125332	LBDI Special Project Account	'002USD1515719106
10	125245	LBDI Special Project Account	'002USD1515719106
11	125246	LBDI Special Project Account	'002USD1515719106
12	125247	LBDI Special Project Account	'002USD1515719106
13	125248	LBDI Special Project Account	'002USD1515719106
14	125249	LBDI Special Project Account	'002USD1515719106
15	41621	LBDI GENERAL USD	'002USD1515719103
16	125248	LBDI Special Project Account	'002USD1515719106
17	125249	LBDI Special Project Account	'002USD1515719106
18	125250	LBDI Special Project Account	'002USD1515719106
19	125251	LBDI Special Project Account	'002USD1515719106



No.	Missing Check #	Account Title	Account #
20	125253	LBDI Special Project Account	'002USD1515719106
21	125254	LBDI Special Project Account	'002USD1515719106
22	1136049	LBDI General Liberia Dollar	'0121915719103
23	1136050	LBDI General Liberia Dollar	'0121915719103
24	1136054	LBDI General Liberia Dollar	'0121915719103
25	10521	LBDI GENERAL USD	'0221515719103

**Appendix 4: Payroll Irregularities**

No.	First Name	Initial	Last Name	Position	Department	Qualification	Employed
1	Richard	S.	Panton	Deputy DG/ Training	Office of DDG	Bsc., MDM	Nov. 1, 1989
2	Pearl	J.L.	Brent	Training Officer	Office of DDG	BBA.	Oct. 1, 2000
3	Eisi	K.	Ogunkoya	Director of Training	Division of Adm. & Training	MA	Sept. 1, 2000
4	Sayonnoh	E.	Toe	Secretary	Division of Adm. & Training	WAEC Cert.	Sept. 1, 1996
5	Tom	N.	Fannoh	Training Assistant	Division of Adm. & Training	Bsc.	May. 1, 2012
6	George	C.	Nyanti	Accounting Instructor	School of Business & Secretarial Science	BSC. ,BBA	July. 1, 2009
7	Harris	F.	Tarnue Sr.	Deputy DG/ Research	Office of DDG/Research and Consultancy	MPSM., MSc.	May. 1, 2004
8	Charles	G.	Jarret	Director of Research	Division of Research & Consultancy	BSc., MPSM	Oct. 1, 2007
9	Reginald	K.	Gaye	Research Specialist I	Division of Research & Consultancy	MHRM	Jun. 1, 2010
10	Gus	B.	Freeman	Research Specialist I	Division of Research & Consultancy	MA	Jun. 1, 2010
11	Konah	B.	Jah	Reference Librarian	Division of Libraries & Information Services	BSC.	May. 1, 2012
12	Lawo	T.R.	Krejarda	Research Assistant II	Division of Libraries & Information Services	BHS.	Dec. 1, 2002
13	Christain	T.G.	Tabla	Special Asst. /DG	Office of Director General	MPSM., MSc.	Oct. 1, 2007
14	Mariama	K.	Kamara	Prog. Dev.	Office of Director General	BBA., MBA	Jan.1, 2011



No.	First Name	Initial	Last Name	Position	Department	Qualification	Employed
				Specialist			
15	Varney	A.	Folley	Secretary	Office of Director General	WAEC/AA	Feb. 1, 2005
16	Richard	G.	Greenfield	Adm. Officer	Office of DDG-Adm. & Management	BBA., DPA	Oct. 1, 2007
17	Luna	A.	Harmon	Accounts Clerk I	Division of Finance & Budget	BBA	April. 1, 2010
18	Ranvia	A.	Jallah	Accounts Clerk I	Division of Finance & Budget	AA., BBA	April. 1, 2010
19	Amos		Gardea	Custodian	Division of General Services & Maintenance	BHS.	Aug. 1, 2002
20	Lahai		Falley	Mechanic	Division of General Services & Maintenance	BHS.	Sept. 1, 1998

#### **Appendix 5: Payment for Honorarium**

Date	Payee	Description	Check #	Amount (LRD)	Amount (USD)
21-Mar-13	Esi K-Ogunkoya	Special Committee Members Honorarium	41652		470.00
26-Apr-13	Francis Tamba	Honorarium for Electrical work done on the building	41703		100.00
26-Apr-13	Foday Swaray	Honorarium for fixing of LIPA Bathroom Door	41704		50.00
16-May-13	Pearl Brent	Payment for honorarium for trainer of trainer workshop	41752		2,500.00
20-May-13	Luna Harmon	Honorarium	41753		4,155.00
18-Mar-13	Mariama Kamara	Honorarium for ASCON training	125269		700.00
27-Nov-12	Pearl J.L. Brent	Honorarium for PSMPT Interview Panal	125327		515.00
24-Jul-12	Princess Clinton	Honorarium for support staff	NIL	10,120.00	
16-Jul-12	NIL	Honorarium for Management team	1136015	36,180.00	
<b>Total</b>				<b>L\$46,300.00</b>	<b>US\$8,490.00</b>



**Appendix 6: Fuel & Lubricant/ Procurement Deviation**

<b>No.</b>	<b>Date</b>	<b>Payee</b>	<b>Voucher No.</b>	<b>Check No.</b>	<b>Amount USD</b>	<b>Missing Documentation</b>
1	15-Oct-12	Super Petroleum	112-0006	NIL	8,452.62	Bid Evaluation Report , Contract Documents,
2	10-Oct.-12	Super Petroleum	0054	1119735	3,500.00	Bid Evaluation Report , Contract Documents,
3	1-Aug-12	Super Petroleum	0013	1119712	3,000.00	Bid Evaluation Report , Contract Documents,
4	17-Jun-13	Super Petroleum	0434	10557	2,500.00	Bid Evaluation Report , Contract Documents,
5	17-Jan-13	Super Petroleum	112-00021	NIL	5,181.00	Bid Evaluation Report , Contract Documents,
6	1-Feb-13	Super Petroleum	112-00029	NIL	6,056.00	Bid Evaluation Report , Contract Documents,
7	21-Sept-12	Super Petroleum	0080	125292	5,000.00	Bid Evaluation Report , Contract Documents,
8	21-Feb-13	Super Petroleum	112-00034	NIL	7,499.00	Bid Evaluation Report , Contract Documents,
9	29-Apr-13	Super Petroleum	122-00045	NIL	3,366.00	Bid Evaluation Report , Contract Documents,
10	8-May-13	Super Petroleum	0346	41730	3,500.00	Bid Evaluation Report , Contract Documents,
<b>Total</b>					<b>US\$48,054.62</b>	

